



**GLENDALE CITY COUNCIL MEETING
Council Chambers
5850 West Glendale Avenue
December 11, 2012
7:00 p.m.**

The meeting was called to order by Mayor Elaine M. Scruggs, with Vice Mayor Steven E. Frate and the following Councilmembers present: Norma S. Alvarez, Joyce V. Clark, Ian Hugh, Yvonne J. Knaack and Manuel D. Martinez.

Also present were Horatio Skeete, Acting City Manager; Jamsheed Mehta, Interim Assistant City Manager; Craig Tindall, City Attorney; and Pamela Hanna, City Clerk.

Mayor Scruggs called for the Pledge of Allegiance and a moment of silence was observed.

COMPLIANCE WITH ARTICLE VII, SECTION 6(c) OF THE GLENDALE CHARTER

A statement was filed by the City Clerk that the 2 resolutions and 5 ordinances to be considered at the meeting were available for public examination and the title posted at City Hall more than 72 hours in advance of the meeting.

APPROVAL OF THE MINUTES OF THE NOVEMBER 26th AND NOVEMBER 27th, 2012 CITY COUNCIL MEETING

It was moved by Councilmember Martinez, and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to dispense with the reading of the minutes of the November 26th and the November 27th, 2012 Regular City Council meeting, as each member of the Council had been provided copies in advance, and approve them as written. The motion carried unanimously.

Mayor Scruggs made a comment and said in reading through the minutes from November 27th, there are areas that are less than clear in terms of their meaning and she suggested that anyone who needs to refer to those minutes for any reason also view the video that is available online to make sure there is a clear understanding of statements that were made.

BOARDS, COMMISSIONS AND OTHER BODIES

This is a request for City Council to approve the recommended appointments to the following boards, commissions and other bodies that have a vacancy or expired term and for the Mayor to administer the Oath of Office to those appointees in attendance.

Arts Commission

Darren Fosdick	Mayoral	Appointment	12/11/2012	08/23/2014
Kaitlyn MacKay	Yucca	Appointment	12/11/2012	08/23/2014

Aviation Advisory Commission

Walter Chaney – Vice Chair	Barrel	Appointment	12/11/2012	11/24/2013
----------------------------	--------	-------------	------------	------------

Citizens Bicycle Advisory Committee

Garrett Simpson	Barrel	Reappointment	01/16/2013	01/16/2015
Scott Richmond	Yucca	Appointment	12/11/2012	07/18/2013

Personnel Board

Richard Westby	Mayoral	Reappointment	01/23/2013	01/23/2014
----------------	---------	---------------	------------	------------

Risk Management/Worker’s Compensation Trust Fund Board

Yvonne Knaack – Councilmember	Barrel	Appointment	01/15/2013	07/24/2014
John Stern – Chair	Cholla	Appointment	01/15/2013	07/24/2013

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to appoint Darren Fosdick and Kaitlyn MacKay to the Arts Commission; Walter Chaney to the Aviation Advisory Commission; Garrett Simpson and Scott Richmond to the Citizens Bicycle Advisory Committee; Richard Westby to the Personnel Board, and Yvonne Knaack and John Stern to the Risk Management/Worker’s Compensation Trust Fund Boards for the terms listed above. The motion carried unanimously.

CONSENT AGENDA

Items on the consent agenda are intended to be acted upon in one motion.

1. SPECIAL EVENT LIQUOR LICENSE, ARIZONA SPORTS FOUNDATION

PRESENTED BY: Susan Matousek, Revenue Administrator

This is a request for City Council to approve a special event liquor license for the Arizona Sports Foundation. The event will be held at University of Phoenix Stadium's Parking Lot located at 1 North Cardinals Drive on Thursday, January 3, 2013, from 12:30 p.m. to 5:30 p.m. The purpose of this special event liquor license is for the 2013 Fiesta Bowl pregame party.

Staff is requesting Council to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

2. LIQUOR LICENSE NO. 5-7869, SO

PRESENTED BY: Susan Matousek, Revenue Administrator

This is a request for City Council to approve a person-to-person, location-to-location transferrable series 7 (Bar - Beer and Wine) license for SO located at 10630 North 59th Avenue, Suite 104. The Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control application (No. 07070501) was submitted by Chang Hui So.

Staff is requesting Council to forward this application to the Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control with a recommendation of approval.

3. TOWING AGREEMENT EXTENSION

PRESENTED BY: Debora Black, Interim Police Chief

This is a request for City Council to authorize the City Manager to enter into a month-to-month extension, for no longer than one year, to the towing agreement with DV Towing, LLC.

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to approve the recommended actions on Consent Agenda Item Nos. 1 through 3, and to forward Special Event Liquor License Application for the Arizona Sports Foundation on January 3, 2013 and Liquor License Application No. 5-7869 for SO to the State of Arizona Department of Liquor Licenses and Control, with the recommendation for approval. The motion carried unanimously.

LAND DEVELOPMENT ACTIONS

4. GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT GPA12-01 (RESOLUTION) AND REZONING APPLICATION ZON12-04 (ORDINANCE): MIDWESTERN UNIVERSITY – 19555 NORTH 59TH AVENUE (PUBLIC HEARING REQUIRED)

PRESENTED BY: Jon M. Froke, AICP, Planning Director

RESOLUTION: 4632

ORDINANCE: 2827

This is a request by Midwestern University for City Council to approve a General Plan Amendment and a Rezoning Application to add 32 acres to the existing 123 acre Midwestern University Planned Area Development (PAD). The properties are located south of the Loop 101 Freeway, between 51st and 59th Avenues.

Staff is requesting Council conduct a public hearing, waive reading beyond the title, and adopt a resolution for GPA12-01 and an ordinance for ZON12-04, subject to the stipulation as recommended by Planning Commission.

Mr. Froke said GPA12-01 is for two areas on the Midwestern campus that are recent land acquisitions. The first request is to amend the general plan land use map from business park (BP) to education (EDU). The second request will amend the general plan from low density residential (LDR) to education (EDU), like the rest of the campus on the general plan. The 32 acres included in the request for the zoning case include the property that Midwestern has acquired over the last 10 years north of the U.S. Post Office. The request is to rezone from A-1,

Agriculture and C-2, General Commercial to PAD, Planned Area Development , which the rest of the campus is zoned. The parcel adjacent to the Loop 101 frontage road would go from A-1 to PAD. It is the property north and east of the Post Office and north of the primary core of campus, the area east of the student housing, the parcel north of Honeywell and the parcel east of the 55th Avenue drainage channel.

Mr. Froke said the original zoning approval for Midwestern occurred in 1996. A new project, a Veterinary Clinic, will come out of this zoning change. The Planning Commission had some general questions about future development. Staff recommends approval of both the general plan amendment and zoning case and request a public hearing be conducted on both items and take a separate action on the general plan amendment and the zoning case.

Mayor Scruggs asked for comment. Kathleen Goepfinger, President and CEO of Midwestern, spoke. She thanked the City for the support in developing the Midwestern campus. She said three additional buildings were going to be built and more than \$100 million will be invested.

Mayor Scruggs opened the public hearing on Agenda Item No. 4. As there were no comments, Mayor Scruggs closed the public hearing.

RESOLUTION NO. 4632 NEW SERIES, A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AMENDING THE ARROWHEAD RANCH SPECIFIC PLAN AND GENERAL PLAN MAP OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, ARIZONA, BY APPROVING GENERAL PLAN AMENDMENT GPA12-01 FOR PROPERTY LOCATED AT 19555 NORTH 59th AVENUE.

ORDINANCE NO. 2827 NEW SERIES, AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, REZONING PROPERTY FROM A-1 (AGRICULTURAL), C-2 (GENERAL COMMERCIAL), AND B-P (BUSINESS PARK) TO PAD (PLANNED AREA DEVELOPMENT) FOR DEVELOPMENT PLAN TITLED “MIDWESTERN UNIVERSITY” LOCATED AT 19555 NORTH 59TH AVENUE; AMENDING THE ZONING MAP; AND PROVIDING FOR AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

Mayor Scruggs asked that the record show that she will not be voting on this item due to a possible conflict of interest.

It was moved by Councilmember Martinez, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to pass, adopt and approve Resolution No. 4632 New Series. Members voting “nay”: none. Mayor Scruggs abstained from the vote for possible conflict of interest. The motion carried.

It was moved by Councilmember Martinez, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to approve Ordinance No. 2827 New Series. Motion carried on a roll call vote, with the following Councilmembers voting “aye”: Alvarez, Clark, Hugh, Knaack, Martinez, and Frate. Members voting “nay”: none. Mayor Scruggs abstained from the vote for possible conflict of interest. The motion carried.

BIDS AND CONTRACTS

5. FEDERAL LEGISLATIVE REPRESENTATION SERVICES FOR THE PROTECTION OF THE MISSION OF LUKE AIR FORCE BASE

PRESENTED BY: Jenna Goad, Interim Assistant to the Mayor

This is a request for City Council to authorize the City Manager to enter into a special procurement professional services agreement with Hyjek & Fix, Inc. for the continuation of federal legislative consultant services for continued protection of the mission of Luke Air Force Base (AFB).

Ms. Goad stated the City has been contracting with this firm since 2006 to protect Luke Air Force Base. In August of this year, Luke Air Force Base was announced as the future home of the F35 Joint Strike Fighter. There are still factors which face Luke Air Force Base, so federal representation is still necessary. The total contract cost is \$144,000 annually. Glendale's share of that cost is just over \$27,000 per year. The rest is split between the remaining 13 other partners who jointly participate in the contract. In the past, Glendale's portion of the cost for this representation was about \$65,000. The current contract expires on December 31, 2012. The new contract would begin January 1, 2013 with an initial term of two years, with three one year agreement renewal options.

Mayor Scruggs said she wanted to give special thanks and recognition to Ms. Goad, who picked this up without having any previous familiarity with the contract and really did a great job in working with Glendale Procurement and thirteen other jurisdictions in bringing this to conclusion, so thank you.

It was moved by Councilmember Clark, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to enter into a professional services agreement with Hyjek & Fix, Inc. for the continuation of federal legislative consultant services. The motion carried unanimously.

6. CONSTRUCTION AGREEMENT WITH MCKENNA CONTRACTING, LLC

PRESENTED BY: Elaine Adamczyk, Housing Services Administrator

This is a request for City Council to authorize the City Manager to enter into a construction agreement with McKenna Contracting, LLC, in an amount not to exceed \$110,480. This construction agreement will allow the City of Glendale's Community Housing Division to replace aging windows and doors within Glendale Public Housing.

Ms. Adamczyk said an RFP was issued and bids were received and McKenna Contracting was the most qualified bidder. The funding source is federal CDBG funds. Council approved funding for this project during the adoption of the FY10-11 CDBG Annual Action Plan. No general funds will be used for this contract.

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to enter into a construction agreement with McKenna Contracting, LLC, in an amount not to exceed \$110,480. The motion carried unanimously.

7. AWARD OF PROPOSAL 13-01, PHILIPS DEFIBRILLATOR SERVICE AGREEMENT
PRESENTED BY: Mark Burdick, Fire Chief

This item was pulled administratively and not heard.

8. AWARD OF BID 13-03, LIGHT TOWER RENTALS FOR STADIUM AND ARENA EVENTS
PRESENTED BY: Debbie Albert, Principal Engineer, Transportation Services

This is a request for City Council to award the bid and authorize the City Manager to enter into an agreement with Pride Group, LLC in an amount not to exceed \$100,000 annually for rental of light towers for events held at Jobing.com Arena and University of Phoenix Stadium.

Ms. Albert said the City is responsible for the parking for events held at Jobing.com and the University of Phoenix Stadium, including which provides for improved safety and security within the parking lots. Lighting is also needed in high pedestrian areas to assist in effectively moving people to and from the event. As a result of moving part of the parking allotment from a large location to three temporary lots near Westgate City Center, there has been an increase in the number of towers required. The anticipated annual cost to provide light towers for 58 arena and stadium events is \$80,000 including equipment and fuel charges. The recommended not to exceed contract amount of \$100,000 will account for additional, unplanned events that may arise. The contract is for a one year period with the option of four 1 year renewals. Expenditures will be based on need. Staff recommends the City enter into an agreement with Pride Group in an amount not to exceed \$100,000 annually.

Councilmember Clark asked about the number of 23 light towers. Ms. Albert said depending on the type of event, the number of light towers required will vary. For a large stadium event or football game, 23 lights towers would be needed. Councilmember Clark asked about renting light towers for a maximum of \$100,000. She asked about the purchase cost for a light tower would be \$9,000, so it would be about \$207,000 to purchase 23 light towers. With the contract renewable for four years, the City could pay up to \$400,000 for the light towers. She asked why the City isn't just buying the towers, as the City could recoup its purchase cost by the 46th event.

Ms. Albert said the nature of some of the lots is they are temporary and there is only a 1 or 2 year agreement for those lots. Because of uncertainty of the needs, it was determined it is in the City's best interest to rent the towers for the time being.

Councilmember Clark said she didn't think the cost of the light towers had anything to do with where the towers will be placed. She understands the locations could change, but the need for the light towers will remain. She will not vote to rent the towers when it would be most cost effective to purchase them.

Mayor Scruggs asked if there were any further explanation from any staff regarding why staff directed the rental because it appears there was a significant analysis and they came up with a different answer.

Ms. Albert said as the area is developed, additional agreements could be made for more permanent parking lots. As parking lot plans are developed and built, this would relieve the City of this temporary lighting problem.

It was moved by Councilmember Knaack, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to enter into an agreement with Pride Group, LLC in an amount not to exceed \$100,000 annually. Councilmember Clark voted nay on the motion. The motion carried.

9. PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH STANLEY CONSULTANTS, INC. FOR 67TH AVENUE INTELLIGENT TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS DESIGN

PRESENTED BY: Debbie Albert, Principal Engineer, Transportation Services

Staff is requesting Council authorize the City Manager to enter into a professional services agreement with Stanley Consultants, Inc., for the design of intelligent transportation systems (ITS) infrastructure on 67th Avenue, between Glendale Avenue and Cholla Street, in an amount not to exceed \$194,878.

Ms. Albert said this would allow the City to deploy ITS infrastructure along arterial streets to enhance the management of traffic, including the ability to remove and control traffic signals and monitor them. This project allows for 7 additional signals and four CCTV cameras to be added to the system. The amount for this project is funded in the GO Transportation Program's Smart Traffic Signals account. The construction of this project is funded through the Federal Congestion Mitigation and Air Quality Program.

Councilmember Clark asked if this project included the roadway all the way to Union Hills. Ms. Albert said the project is approximately 3.5 miles and does not connect to Union Hills. Councilmember Clark asked why the project takes place in the middle of 67th Avenue, instead of starting at a main intersection and then going 3.5 miles up. She asked if there would be a bigger traffic mess by not starting the project at a main intersection.

Ms. Albert said there are two other projects currently under design and also federally funded that will connect many of the intersections along 67th Avenue, between Union Hills and Peoria Avenue. Also, there was a previous project along Olive Avenue that covered some of the project area. This project is part of a larger picture.

Councilmember Clark asked about the area from Camelback to Glendale. Ms. Albert said this is within the strategic plan that the City is developing for ITS. This will come along with a funding request in the future. Councilmember Clark asked if the ITS system is activated right away after it is constructed and how it works with systems that are not tied to it.

Ms. Albert said the system is activated immediately as soon as testing is completed. There are challenges in managing the transportation system because there are some locations that are not connected. Transportation relies heavily on federal funds and the money that is available to build the system out. They program the limitations of the resources into the projects that they feel would best build the system in order to complete it.

Councilmember Clark asked on what basis was the middle portion chosen, rather than starting from the north and working down or starting from the south and working up.

Ms. Albert said in 2003, the project was started with cable on 59th Avenue and they have branched out from there. A likely starting point would be Glendale Avenue because that ties them back into the existing communications infrastructure.

Mayor Scruggs said since you are talking about going end to end on 67th Avenue. As you well know, 67th Avenue doesn't end at Union Hills, but rather we go up to Beardsley and then Deer Valley and then Pinnacle Peak Road and the congestion in that area is just beyond anything that can be described. She didn't know if that ties into the backbone system anywhere. Could you tell us what the future plans are for the stretch between Union Hills north to the limit of our City.

Ms. Albert said that already is connected to the system. A couple of years ago, the City was able to connect up everything north of Bell Road into the system.

Mayor Scruggs asked so if things aren't working well, we can complain and ask for modifications.

Ms. Albert said they do routinely speak to residents and are able to make adjustments as they can given the limitation of the system.

Mayor Scruggs asked is there a limitation because of the freeway, because of the 101 going through there, and does ADOT get some sort of control that overrides us.

Ms. Albert said that is one of the challenges they face as they do not control the signals along the Loop 101.

Mayor Scruggs said and the monitoring system does the staff that monitors the area notice situations that could be smoothed out or improved during morning rush hours and evening rush hours, particularly between Union Hills and Deer Valley.

Ms. Albert said that is definitely something they are concerned about. They have looked at regional fund as well as federal funding to get the best information so they can make decisions on how to time the signals given the traffic demands in that area.

Mayor Scruggs said she was trying to think how many signals there are between Beardsley, Loop 101 and Deer Valley, a couple, three, maybe. The City of Glendale would have control over timing sequencing of those signals, would we not?

Ms. Albert said that was correct.

Mayor Scruggs said quite honestly, there are some serious situations, one of which is the design of the off ramp from the 101 at 67th Avenue and the limited space. She realized this is not something that may change, but the limited space for those exiting the 101 to move over to the lanes closest to the north so they can then turn right on 67th Avenue is a problem. There is a lot of backup, and a tremendous amount of cross traffic in a very short amount of space. Is there anything that can be done with timing of signals, maybe north of Beardsley, to allow more people to access through more quickly and alleviate the very serious backups that happen right there?

Ms. Albert said staff would have look at that specific issue to see if there is something that can be done.

Mayor Scruggs said for anyone who has traveled that, it is really a situation of extreme danger. She believed the root cause is the short space between where people exit the 101 and getting into whatever lane they need to get into to continue their travels. So, then, if there is a backup when you go further north because there are shopping centers at Rose Garden and everything going on with the apartments and so forth. Is something that can be done, she thought it might save a lot of vehicles and a lot of damage and maybe some injuries, too. The evening rush hour, in particular, she believed you are aware of the situation.

Ms. Albert said they will look into it.

It was moved by Councilmember Knaack, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to enter into a professional services agreement with Stanley Consultants, Inc., in an amount not to exceed \$194,878. The motion carried unanimously.

**10. PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH RIDER LEVETT BUCKNALL, LTD.
FOR LIFE-CYCLE COST ASSESSMENT**

PRESENTED BY: Stuart Kent, Executive Director, Public Works

Staff is requesting Council authorize the City Manager to enter into a professional services agreement with Rider Levett Bucknall, Ltd. (RLB) in an amount not to exceed \$120,341 to develop a total life-cycle cost assessment for the following city-owned facilities: Jobing.Com Arena, the Renaissance Glendale Convention and Media Center, and Camelback Ranch in Glendale.

Mr. Kent said the City owns all of the above-mentioned facilities and is responsible for capital maintenance and repairs for each of them. The facility operators are responsible for routine operational and maintenance costs. RLB will do an independent assessment of the overall condition of the facilities and the findings will be shared with each of the facility operators so the operators can have input into the report before it is finalized. The report will include a schedule of anticipated capital repairs for each of the next five fiscal years individually as well as subsequent years in five year increments over the anticipated life of the facility. An assessment

of the buildings and the capital placement schedule is appropriate now for proper financial planning. RLB has conducted these types of assessments for more than twenty years.

Councilmember Clark asked why the Civic Center wasn't included in this assessment. Before the economy went bad, the City was allocating \$100,000 a year for maintenance costs, but that hasn't been done for a couple of years.

Mr. Kent said they have assessed a number of other City facilities and the Civic Center currently has \$50,000 per year in ongoing funding to do some of the capital repairs that need to be done. This assessment is to plan for the future to address what costs there might be.

Councilmember Clark said the criteria seems to be if the facility is commercially operated, the assessment will be done, but if it is the City owned and operated facility, the City doesn't need to do an assessment.

Mr. Kent said that is not exactly correct. The three facilities have agreements that the City is obligated to have a capital reserve account set up for them and is obligated to fund that. Unlike the other facilities where there is no contractual obligation to set aside a certain amount of money each year for certain components that need to be replaced, these facilities have contracts which require this.

Councilmember Clark said she understood this, but the Civic Center has always been rated as a number one facility in the Valley and the City would like to keep it in that condition with that rating. She believes the City owned and operated facilities should be on a regular schedule as well so major maintenance and repair can be scheduled.

Mayor Scruggs addressed Mr. Kent the fiscal impact section of the write up says that this will involve an appropriation authority transfer, \$120,341 from the GIS Enterprise System Pago Capital Project to a new Pago project. Additionally, the remaining appropriation authority of \$294,966 in the GIS Pago Capital Project will be transferred, and so forth. What was originally planned for that money, which is the GIS Enterprise System Pago Capital Project account?

Mr. Kent said the original project titled the GIS Enterprise System, was an expansion of server capacity supporting the City network. Mr. Murphy and his staff have been able to give us a virtualization process. This creates additional capacity without having to buy additional servers. The project is no longer needed, so the appropriation authority in the project, the \$120,341, is moved to fund this account. The remainder is being put back into contingency so it is not being appropriated and not being spent, but put back as reserve in the event that any other projects were needed.

Mayor Scruggs said so you are saying that the intended use of that money has been accomplished in a different format.

Mr. Kent said that was correct.

Mayor Scruggs said when you bring up IT and we are aware of all the raids on the technology replacement fund that has caused some concerns.

Mr. Kent said this is not part of the IT reserve, just like it is not part of the vehicle replacement fund account. This is a separate account that is a cash capital project. When the necessity for the project went away, they made the determination that a portion of the funding could be used for this project and the remainder set aside for future projects as needed.

Mayor Scruggs said that helps a lot. She asked if Mr. Murphy was in the audience. She wanted to congratulate him on his innovativeness and creativity in making it so both things can be done.

Mr. Murphy said through training, they were able to implement this new technology. They leveraged the current hardware they have and took a single server and made it look like three or four servers. That allowed them to not have to make the purchase as originally planned.

Councilmember Clark asked if IT went to the cloud to increase server capacity.

Mr. Murphy said they did not; this is in-house capacity that is in place.

Councilmember Clark asked if IT developed a program or if there was a program already that allowed them to expand the capacity of the current servers.

Mr. Murphy said it is commercially available and they have used it in other applications. They worked with the GIS vendor and got clearance from them that they would support it if the City virtualized it. The added benefit was when the servers are leveraged like this, maintenance costs are reduced, so instead of paying maintenance on additional computers, they only pay maintenance on one.

Councilmember Alvarez asked about a new CIP department being created. She said we don't have any money to create a new department.

Mr. Kent said they are creating an account to fund this RLB project, \$120,000. That account will be created from the \$120,000 in savings from the IT project, so they are not creating a new expenditure. They are appropriating and transferring dollars from a project that doesn't need to be spent and moving a portion of that to this project.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if the account was going to be managed by IT.

Mr. Kent said the account would be managed by himself and the Engineering Department. The remaining funds will go back into account reserve and that will be managed by the Budget and Finance staff.

Mayor Scruggs said the only remaining question she had is about the appropriation authority transfer, so she will look to Mr. Tindall to ask for his comment on whether this is the right time of the year, the right process and all of these transfers are legal according to the information he has provided regarding when such things can happen.

Mr. Tindall said the transfer is consistent with the state budget law and with respect to the restrictions of the transfer, they are not moving money between departments, which is the other secondary restriction. This is all being done in the CIP account. This is consistent with both the City Charter and the budget law.

Mayor Scruggs said in keeping with our new era of full disclosure, she would probably be asking Mr. Tindall similar questions as Council talks about appropriations and transfers and so forth.

It was moved by Councilmember Martinez, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to enter into a professional services agreement with Rider Levett Bucknall, Ltd. in an amount not to exceed \$120,341. The motion carried unanimously.

11. PROFESSIONAL SERVICES AGREEMENT WITH BLACK & VEATCH CORPORATION FOR EFFLUENT PIPELINE CONDITION ASSESSMENT

PRESENTED BY: Craig Johnson, P.E., Executive Director, Water Services

This is a request for City Council to authorize the City Manager to enter into a professional services agreement for an assessment of the Arrowhead Ranch effluent pipeline and recharge well system. This agreement is with Black & Veatch Corporation in an amount not to exceed \$682,050.

Mr. Johnson said the pipeline conveys treated effluent from the Arrowhead Ranch Reclamation Facility to the Arrowhead Ranch Master Planned Community Lake System. Due to the pipeline age and well system efficiency issues, an assessment is recommended. The assessment will allow the City to remain proactive to minimize risks, system failures and service interruptions. It is planned during the winter months when the flows are lower. An RFQ was issued in June 2012 and Black & Veatch was determined to be the most qualified firm. Funds for the project were budgeted in the 2012/13 Capital Improvement Program.

Councilmember Clark asked if there have been any interruptions in service as a result of the aging equipment to date.

Mr. Johnson said there have not been any interruptions.

Councilmember Martinez said in the background summary, it said no problems were found. He asked at what point would another assessment be done.

Mr. Johnson said once the initial test is done and a determination is made as to what is going on with the system right now, the computer system is not providing efficiency for the flow of recharge fluid below ground the way they anticipate it should be and that is why this assessment is needed. Once the assessment is completed and the changes are made, they won't make another assessment for the recharge system until it gives them some indication that it needs to happen again.

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to enter into a professional services agreement with Black & Veatch Corporation in an amount not to exceed \$682,050. The motion carried unanimously.

12. PURCHASE OF ULTRAVIOLET EQUIPMENT PARTS AND SUPPLIES

PRESENTED BY: Craig Johnson, P.E., Executive Director, Water Services

This is a request for City Council to authorize the purchase of parts and supplies for the ultraviolet (UV) disinfection systems at the West Area and Arrowhead Ranch Water Reclamation Facilities. These purchases will be made from DC Frost Associates Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$400,000 annually.

Mr. Johnson said both reclamation facilities use UV disinfecting light along with supplemental chlorine addition to complete the final disinfection phase of the reclamation treatment process. This helps the reclaimed water maintain an A plus quality rating, which is what is required by permit. The systems have parts being replaced on a regular basis. These systems are proprietary in nature and Trojan Technologies is the only manufacturer of the UV systems and has designated DC Frost as the sole authorized representative for Arizona. Materials Management concurs with the sole source purchase and funds are available in the 2012/13 Water Services Operating Budget.

Vice Mayor Frate asked if this was the first time parts were being replaced or is this an ongoing process.

Mr. Johnson said this has been ongoing.

It was moved by Councilmember Clark, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to authorize the purchase of parts and supplies from DC Frost Associates Inc. in an amount not to exceed \$400,000 annually. The motion carried unanimously.

13. AUTHORIZATION FOR WATER RECLAMATION BLOWER MAINTENANCE SERVICES

PRESENTED BY: Craig Johnson, P.E., Executive Director, Water Services

This is a request for City Council to authorize the purchase of equipment and services for the maintenance of blowers at the West Area Water Reclamation Facility. Maintenance services will be done by Western Environmental Equipment Company in an amount not to exceed \$177,604.90.

Mr. Johnson said the blowers at the West Area Water Reclamation Facility are used to provide the high volume of air needed during the biological process for treating sewage. The West Area Water Reclamation Facility has three blowers which run 24 hours a day, every day. All blowers are due for scheduled maintenance. The blower system is proprietary in nature and Sings Energy, Incorporated is the sole provider of Turbo X products and has designated Western Environmental Equipment Company as their exclusive representative for maintenance and

repairs. Materials Management concurs with the sole source purchase and funds are available in the 2012/13 Water Services Operating Budget.

It was moved by Councilmember Knaack, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to authorize the purchase of equipment and services by Western Environmental Equipment Company in an amount not to exceed \$177,604.90. The motion carried unanimously.

ORDINANCES

14. TRANSFER OF PROPERTY WITH MIDWESTERN UNIVERSITY

PRESENTED BY: Gregory Rodzenko, P.E., Acting City Engineer

ORDINANCE: 2828

This is a request for City Council to adopt an ordinance authorizing the City Manager to authorize the transfer of property of a city-owned parcel to Midwestern University in exchange for roadway improvements constructed by Midwestern University. Staff is requesting Council waive reading beyond the title and adopt an ordinance authorizing the City Manager to execute the documents necessary to complete the land transfer.

Mr. Rodzenko said in 2011, at the request of City staff, Midwestern University constructed roadway improvements to 57 Avenue and the Loop 101 frontage road, including 57th Avenue intersection safety concern. The City is obligated to construct these safety improvements relative to standards for municipal road design. The City-owned parcel to be transferred was deeded to Glendale by Arrowhead Ranch in 1985 for drainage purposes. The parcel was split into two and each parcel was required for the 55th Avenue drainage channel. The west parcel is a remnant and is of no use to the City and should be transferred to Midwestern. It is about 50,000 square feet in size, a little over an acre. Midwestern spent approximate \$900,000 for the intersection and street improvements, compared to the fair market value of the City parcel, which is estimated at no more than \$46,000. There are no costs incurred by the City as a result of this action.

Mayor Scruggs asked that the record show that she will not be voting on this item due to a possible conflict of interest.

ORDINANCE NO. 2828 NEW SERIES, AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING THE TRANSFER OF PROPERTY TO MIDWESTERN UNIVERSITY OF REAL PROPERTY LOCATED SOUTH OF BEARDSLEY ROAD BETWEEN 57TH AVENUE AND THE 55TH AVENUE DRAINAGE CHANNEL AND NEAR THE INTERSECTION WITH THE LOOP 101 FRONTAGE ROAD; AND ORDERING THAT A CERTIFIED COPY OF THIS ORDINANCE BE RECORDED.

It was moved by Councilmember Martinez, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to pass, adopt and approve Ordinance No. 2828 New Series. Motion carried on a roll call vote, with the following Councilmembers voting “aye”: Alvarez, Clark, Hugh, Knaack, Martinez, and Frate. Members voting “nay”: none. Mayor Scruggs abstained from vote for possible conflict of interest. The motion carried unanimously.

15. CITY CODE CHAPTER XIII ORDINANCE AMENDMENTS

PRESENTED BY: Elizabeth Finn, Presiding Judge

ORDINANCE: 2829

This is a request for City Council to waive reading beyond the title and adopt an ordinance amending provisions of the Glendale City Code contained in Chapter XIII concerning compensation of Glendale City Court judicial officers.

The existing ordinance was adopted in 2002. The proposed amendment is intended to address current circumstances and future changes in court operations and administration.

Judge Finn said this issue has been addressed in the past and has been discussed in executive session and at a Workshop. The existing Ordinances were enacted to limit the occasions Council was required to address the salaries of City Court Judges and the Court Hearing Officers. The current Ordinance does not adequately address what may occur in the event a new presiding judge is appointed at a lesser salary. In such case, there would be inequitable adjustments to the salaries of the City Court Judges and the Court Hearing Officers. Judge Finn evaluated the situation with Mr. Tindall and their recommendation to best address this situation is Ordinance No. 2829. There is no fiscal impact.

Councilmember Clark asked what the solution was.

Judge Finn said the solution was to revise the Ordinance so that if a presiding judge is appointed at a lesser salary, the City Court Judges and the Court Hearing Officer maintain the same salary until the 85% and the 60% are established. The City Ordinances currently say that the City Court Judges receive 85% of the presiding judge's salary and the Court Hearing Officer receives 60%. The ordinance revision provides if those percentages shrink because a new presiding judge is appointed at a lesser salary, the City Court Judge's and the Court Hearing Officer would be frozen until the percentage gap could be established again.

Councilmember Knaack thanked Judge Finn for being proactive and taking care of this issue.

ORDINANCE NO. 2829 NEW SERIES, AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AMENDING GLENDALE CITY CODE, CHAPTER 13 (CITY COURT), ARTICLE 1 (IN GENERAL), SEC. 13-6 (COMPENSATION OF JUDICIAL OFFICERS; AND SETTING FORTH AN EFFECTIVE DATE.

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to pass, adopt and approve Ordinance No. 2829 New Series. Motion carried on a roll call vote, with the following Councilmembers voting "aye": Alvarez, Clark, Hugh, Knaack, Martinez, and Frate and Scruggs. Members voting "nay": none. The motion carried.

16. FISCAL YEAR 2012-13 BUDGET AMENDMENTS – WATER/SEWER FULL-TIME EMPLOYEES TO GENERAL FUND

PRESENTED BY: Sherry Schurhammer, Executive Director, Financial Services
ORDINANCE: 2830

This is a request for City Council to waive reading beyond the title and adopt an ordinance approving the transfer of 3.5 Full Time Employees (FTEs) from the Water/Sewer Enterprise Fund, and the associated appropriation authority from the Water/Sewer Fund to the General Fund (GF), both of which are within the Financial Services Department.

Ms. Schurhammer said the appropriation authority will transfer between divisions within the same department, the financial services department. The transfer of 3.5 FTEs involves the transfer of appropriation authority. The duties of one of the 3.5 FTEs has changed over the last few years from primarily water/sewer billing issues to sales tax and licensing issues as a result of the implementation of several new technology systems. The remaining 2.5 FTEs for temporary removal by the Human Resources from the general fund to the water and sewer fund. The employees were moved back in 2009 and that move should have been reversed by HR at that time when other general fund positions became vacant through attrition. That did not happen and they are attempting to fix the situation with this request. Glendale's total appropriation authority across all funds remains unchanged.

Councilmember Clark commented that this is another situation where HR has had to fix something. She wanted to make it clear that Mr. Brown inherited a mess in HR and he has spent time fixing a lot of things that occurred under the previous HR Manager. She didn't want to give the impression that this happened on Mr. Brown's watch because she knows it didn't.

Councilmember Alvarez said they are transferring from the general fund to the water trust fund.

Ms. Schurhammer said they are not transferring funds. They are moving the authorized FTE positions.

Councilmember Alvarez said she thought there was no money in the general fund.

Ms. Schurhammer said this is one of the items that was included in the 20 year financial analysis that was shown to the Council on November 27th. The forecasts included the fixes that needed to be done for the Risk Management Trust Fund and Workers' Comp Trust Fund. They also included this in there. All of that will be covered by the reductions that will be brought forward on December 18th.

Councilmember Alvarez said the trust funds was something that was legally done and asked if the transfer were okay to be done.

Ms. Schurhammer said this specific item just addresses the water/sewer FTEs that are moving over to the general fund. The other two items coming forward tonight will deal with Risk and Workers' Comp.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if there was enough money in the general fund for those 3.5 FTEs.

Ms. Schurhammer said they have accounted for that in the updated analysis.

Mayor Scruggs asked Ms. Schurhammer, she thought the reasoning for the temporary move does not quite match up with what was really going on at that time. What was the year in which we were paying incentives to people to retire?

Ms. Schurhammer indicated the retirement incentive program was offered in early calendar year 2009, which was the last half of fiscal year 2009. That program was offered at that time in order to help balance the budget for FY10. The reality was that some of the individuals who participated in the program did not leave by the end FY09. Some of them stayed until early summer because a couple of them needed an extra month or two to reach their retirement eligible age. There were just a few exceptions to everyone being out the door by the end of 2009.

Mayor Scruggs said so we helped them out the door so we could free up money in the general fund, but as she recalled, there was quite a contentious workshop discussion about why the positions were being held as vacant positions. She was very concerned about the large number of positions and she was told we have to have those for flexibility because if there is a vacancy in a critical area, HR has to be able to go out and recruit so the critical position could be filled. She thought at that time, there were something like 67 open positions. She knew that she was certainly not in the majority in her concern about why we were holding these positions open and Assistant City Manager Kavanaugh was very adamant those positions had to stay there. She was trying to fit that in with how there was this need to transfer these 2.5 FTEs to water/sewer fund because it would have been detrimental to the department and organization if they were gone. So, in other words, these 2.5 positions directly fit the reason why Ms. Kavanaugh was giving for the absolute requirement that these vacant FTEs be retained. So, why was this decision to move people over when we were holding vacant FTEs.

Ms. Schurhammer said she does not know the answer. She is trying to explain what another department did three years ago and now we are trying to fix it. She recalled that some of the positions left open were in public safety. Those were separate.

Mayor Scruggs said you always like to use public safety as a reason for everything, but the positions were throughout the organization.

Ms. Schurhammer said yes and agreed they were throughout the organization, but there were some in public safety. She said as part of the FY10 budget, they eliminated about 110 positions, but they would have been eliminated with a July 1st date of the fiscal year.

Mayor Scruggs said the premise was always that critical positions would not be eliminated if they were needed to carry on the duties, so the appearance is that these positions were moved to water and sewer because that is an enterprise fund and that is not going to get touched and then we have more money available in the general fund. She had two questions. What caused somebody to suddenly decide maybe we should go back and rectify this? That is question number one. Question number two is are we going to repay the water and sewer fund for the salaries that were paid out of that fund because we needed to relieve the general fund? Just as

we are going back and repaying Risk Management Trust Fund for improperly paying salaries out of there, are we going to go back and repay the water and sewer trust fund? Are there any other FTEs that are being paid out of the enterprise funds that belong in the general fund, and what is the impact of this on the rate payer?

Ms. Schurhammer said they are trying to fix this now because they have known about this problem and are trying to fix it.

Mayor Scruggs asked what suddenly has caused you to decide to go back and fix these old problems. This one should not have existed in the first place, but go on.

Ms. Schurhammer said at this point, they are trying to implement these fixes and they are bringing all three of these items forward tonight to try and get this done at this point in time. As far as repaying the water and sewer fund, if the consensus decision is to do that, they can bring something back to take care of that.

Mayor Scruggs asked are there any other positions that are being paid out of water and sewer, or sanitation for that matter, or any of the enterprise funds that should belong in the general fund.

Ms. Schurhammer said she was not aware of any.

Mayor Scruggs said she suggested that in order to complete the reversal of an action that she guessed was assumed to be for a very short period of time, but to her, makes no sense whatsoever, that staff look into the amount needed to repay the water and sewer fund for the payment of these FTEs' salaries and benefits. She realized that she was one person making that request, but she thought under our new way of Council getting to bring matters of special interest forward, just as Councilmember Clark has asked you to look into coming up with a plan for capital improvements to the Civic Center, she believed that in order to complete the rectification of actions taken that were less than appropriate, this should be done.

Councilmember Alvarez said on this decision of the FTEs, isn't this going through budget or is it the decision of the director. She said she was not allowed to do that as a program administrator, which is the same as a director.

Ms. Schurhammer said budget was not aware that this was done until after the fact. At that time, that is what happened.

Councilmember Alvarez asked why wasn't budget aware of what was happening.

Ms. Schurhammer said they were not informed this was going to be done. She couldn't explain why they were not informed. She did not know that it was going to be done.

Councilmember Alvarez said her vote will be no. She said not being aware of what was happening is no excuse, especially when they are dealing with taxpayers' money. The people that made the decisions are gone, but there are people still here that held responsibility.

Mayor Scruggs followed up on Councilmember Alvarez's statements by saying it wasn't just the originating end, which is HR. You are portraying that Human Resources made this decision. She just can't even imagine how Human Resources would have pulled this out of the sky to do this without talking to budget or getting direction from upper management, but they are the receiving end. Why did the directors over utilities department agree to accept three FTEs into their budget that did not even belong on their department? How does something like that happen? You have the end that is originating it and then the end that is receiving it and budget you are saying did not know any of this was going on. Councilmember Alvarez is saying this type of action is one more that is coming forward that they are finding out about. How many more are there? What prevents these types of things from happening again? How did this happen in the first place? How can another department, especially one that has an enterprise fund, accept this new cost and not tell anybody and not say well these people don't work for me, I don't need them? You are going to answer that you are only the budget director and you are just reporting the transfer of numbers. Mr. Skeete had mentioned to her a while back that, meaning about a week ago, that maybe it's high time that people who were involved in actions such as these, start explaining what they were doing and why they were doing it, versus having someone who says we didn't know anything about it, we are just the number keeper.

Ms. Schurhammer said they have implemented procedures so that it does not happen in the future. They found out about these transfers after the fact. Once they found out about it, they went to HR and they figured out how to prevent it from happening in the future, so now when they get paperwork, personnel action forms, that are requesting, that they always call budget first and ask if this can be done based on where the funding it. A process has been implemented so it cannot happen in the future.

Mayor Scruggs asked when did staff discover this.

Ms. Schurhammer said it would have been in 2010 and they discovered it sometime after that.

Mayor Scruggs said two years ago? And now you are going to correct this?

Ms. Schurhammer said it has been brought forward now to correct.

Councilmember Clark said she thought they were spending a lot of time killing the messenger. She said the reason many of these things are being brought to light and corrected is the result of Mr. Skeete and his willingness to acknowledge there were practices that were less than kosher and they are being corrected. Councilmember Clark said she didn't even remember who was the water director in 2009, but it was someone who is not there anymore. She acknowledged there were bad practices going on that they did not know about, but she commended staff for the fact that they are willing to bring them to light now and to put procedures in place to correct them. She acknowledged the issues that Mayor Scruggs and Councilmember Alvarez had, but she wanted to acknowledge that the issues are being corrected and the people bringing these items forward are not necessarily the people who conspired at the time of the bad acts.

Mayor Scruggs said she had some agreements and some disagreements with what Councilmember Clark said. She doesn't mean to shoot the messenger. Ms. Schurhammer is the

only person that is offered to us for an explanation. Perhaps, the better thing would have been to have the department that originated this bad act and the department that went along with it by receiving it, but you are the person put in front of us. She didn't think we were shooting the messenger. She didn't think the messenger was going to refuse to come forward with information in the future, because she thought the situation has reached a critical point where no more will there be information that is withheld. It will be discovered one way or the other. She wanted to agree with Councilmember Clark that during Mr. Skeete's short time as the Acting City Manager, he has brought many matters forward for disclosure, albeit painful to him, she was sure in many instances, especially since he was in positions that were part of the chain of individuals who were involved, so she wanted to commend him. At the same time, she couldn't say this is all great because this was discovered in 2010 and here we are two years later, correcting it. She can't say that at all. She can't agree at all. She thought, perhaps, the reason why now two years later it is being corrected is because so many other things have been brought to light that people are going back and saying well maybe we should rectify this that we knew about two years ago. She appreciated that there are practices in place and she will remain in direct contrast and opposition with the majority of the City Council who believe these things happened, they are over and done with, let's not talk about them anymore because this is a new day and everything is great and it doesn't do any good to talk about these things. She disagreed with that one hundred percent. She would share with you a comment that was made to her by an employee of the City of Glendale who sat through our very painful workshop last Tuesday. That employee said Mayor, we, the employees, need to know what happened, why it happened, who caused it to happen, because only then can the healing begin. So, she would remain in opposition with your position that it is over, it's done with, let's not talk about it. These things must be talked about, our citizens demand this.

She was going to ask Mr. Tindall if there is a way in which she could offer an amendment to the Ordinance and that amendment is that the general fund repay the water and sewer fund for all costs of compensation for the FTEs that were transferred over there supposedly on a temporary basis. You don't have to answer this second, Councilmember Alvarez wishes to speak, but before we vote on this or before the Ordinance is read, she was going to ask if there is a way for her to offer that amendment.

Councilmember Alvarez agreed with Mayor Scruggs and said there are too many things going on and employees have brought her proof of what was happening. She said this should never have happened. There are too many people in upper management for this to happen. It affects people that are going to hurt when they are laid off at the end of the year. Those people are going to be without jobs because of somebody's mistake or not knowing what was going on and that is not acceptable by the public. The employees need a salary and we need to know. She is always going to be asking. The first year she didn't ask questions, but after learning of the favoritism, the money and things that were happening, it is not going to happen. People are going to come and let them all know who they hired, who crossed the line and they are taking a job away from someone else, they are taking taxpayers' money. She is not placing blame, but they have to be more alert to justify their pay.

Councilmember Knaack asked that there were only 3.5 employees moved from the general fund to the water and sewer fund in the last four or five years. She said she knows of one person who was moved just this year from the general fund to the water fund.

Ms. Schurhammer said there is a difference between moving an authorized position and moving an employee from a position that is funded in one fund to a vacant position that is funded in another fund. She said she didn't know what case Councilmember Knaack was talking about.

Councilmember Knaack said there aren't supposed to be any vacant positions at this point. In 2009 or 2010, there were 90 vacancies at that point which they questioned why are we holding onto all these vacancies. She said they should have pushed it because they wouldn't be in this bad position.

Mayor Scruggs said they did push it and thank you for correcting it. It was 90 something. She and Councilmember Knaack did push it and boy it was pushed back right at us.

Councilmember Knaack said a lot of the management people are gone now that held a great responsibility for the things that have happened, especially in HR. Her question to Mr. Skeete was he was over Finance since 2008, so her concern if he had been, why he would not know that this is going on. There is more stuff coming out every day.

Mr. Skeete said there have been a number of general fund and other employees across the organization that go from one fund to another. There have been vacancies in the water and sanitation departments that employees for the general fund have applied for and were filled with employees from other departments across the organization. All vacant positions are not frozen and there have been a number of employees that feel qualified and met the qualifications and went through the internal interview process and were selected by the departments to fill vacancies in other departments and in other funds across the organization. There have been much more than three positions of people moving from the general fund into the enterprise funds over the last three to five years. Currently, vacant positions are reviewed by the HR Department and submitted to Mr. Skeete for final review and authorization as to whether it is deemed essential and necessary and is approved for filling. Because of the state of the general fund and the economy, the process has always been any vacant position available is first posted internally for one or two weeks. If it is not filled or there are not enough applicants, then it is posted externally for recruitment. This has been a long-standing practice and that practice continues. When the positions are posted, if there are adequate qualified internal employees, they are given the opportunity to apply for those positions. There are about 20 vacancies in the water and sewer department. They are actively recruiting for at least 10 of those vacancies. He said last week he approved 4 vacancies in the police department for recruitment. If there are not enough qualified applicants within the organization, those will then go to an external recruitment process.

Councilmember Knaack said she felt like the enterprise fund is a catch all fund for everything. She said that is her perception. She understands the situation that those employees are no longer focused on water billing and should not be funded out of that and moved back to the general fund.

Councilmember Martinez said to Mr. Skeete that someone had to give the final approval for these actions. He asked who that person would have been in these instances.

Mr. Skeete said the process of evaluating the actions taken during the budget reductions and reorganization that took place in 2010 was a collective decision made by the management team. Various departments and individuals were given responsibility for presenting to the City Manger solutions and alternatives for his consideration.

Councilmember Martinez asked if it followed the chain of command and came to the management team. He said Mr. Skeete was the head of the management team and his recommendation went to the City Manager.

Mr. Skeete said he was only appointed head of the management team in June of this year. He never considered himself head of any management team for the 7 ½ years before that.

Mayor Scruggs asked what was your position, were you Deputy City Manager, were you a director? They are thinking you were either City Manager or Assistant City Manager back in 09/10.

Mr. Skeete said back in 09/10, he was Deputy City Manager over Finance, Budget, IT and HR.

Mayor Scruggs asked so did you know about it?

Mr. Skeete said he was not aware of the fact that those positions were paid for by the water fund. When he became aware of that fact recently, he instructed Ms. Schurhammer and the sales tax department that they immediately had to fix that issue.

Councilmember Martinez said Ms. Schurhammer has advised that although these things have happened, that they won't happen again. He also said that Human Resources will keep them advised.

Ms. Schurhammer said Human Resources calls her whenever there are any requests for changes to existing positions.

Councilmember Martinez asked if it was just a call or a piece of paper that goes out to show exactly what is happening so it is recorded.

Ms. Schurhammer said sometimes when it is something very simple; it is just a phone call. Other times, when the issue is more complicated, they will get a copy sent by email to them of what has been proposed and then her office will respond.

Councilmember Martinez said in his experience there was a piece of paper for every action taken that you could point to in order to prove what happened. He recommended very strongly that, in the future, there be a paper trail from the very beginning showing who authorized everything down the line.

Ms. Schurhammer said she believed that is what is happening now.

Councilmember Martinez said Mr. Skeete has submitted a corrective action plan and rather than continuing to point fingers, they need to move on, as long as there is a procedure in place that these things will not happen again.

Mayor Scruggs said she needed to go back to this, we have rehashed and gone over and there is no reason to talk about it. There is a reason to talk about it because financial statements were prepared and presented to the public and to the financial community, some of whom assisted in bond issues. Those financial statements and those budget books were not accurate. To say there is no reason to talk about this, you know we might just hear from some of those bond underwriting companies or others involved in this that say there were irregularities and we acted upon those irregularities. Do you say that was in the past, let's not talk about.

Councilmember Martinez said he did not say that.

Mayor Scruggs said but there is a reason why we continue to pursue this. Now, she wanted to go back to some things. Mr. Skeete, where did Mr. Lynch fit in all of this, Art Lynch? Did you report to Art Lynch? Where was he in all of this? Wasn't he in the financial world in the City of Glendale?

Mr. Skeete said that is correct. He said he did not report to Mr. Lynch. Mr. Lynch was advising the City Manager and was responsible for a lot of the financing operations and recommendations.

Mayor Scruggs said but usually when there was a need to find money, it was Mr. Lynch who determined how money could be moved around and come forward. Now, where did Ms. Kavanaugh fit in all of this, because there seems to be some feeling that you were directly responsible for all of this? Where did Ms. Kavanaugh fit with relation to Mr. Beasley and Mr. Lynch and you?

Mr. Skeete said Ms. Kavanaugh was the Assistant City Manager and she was responsible for the operations. They all reported to Ms. Kavanaugh.

Mayor Scruggs said we all, meaning?

Mr. Skeete said all of the Deputy City Managers reported to Ms. Kavanaugh.

Mayor Scruggs said and she reported to Mr. Beasley. What about Mr. Lynch, did he report to Ms. Kavanaugh?

Mr. Skeete said Mr. Lynch had a dual reporting mechanism where he reported to Ms. Kavanaugh and to Mr. Beasley.

Mayor Scruggs said so this is a very complicated situation. She was still just intrigued with how budget would not know this was happening. Budget prepared the budget books and the budget books detail how many FTEs there are in each department.

Ms. Schurhammer said they do prepare the budget book. Every year when the preliminary budget book is prepared that is done in the beginning of May. They run a staffing report out of the HRMS system which is part of PeopleSoft. It is based on what is in HRMS as of May 1st. If there are changes that occur after May 1st, they don't know about them immediately, but they will eventually find out about them. As of May 1st, what they put in the budget book, it reflects what was in HRMS at that time. If some of the changes or temporary moves were done, if they occurred after that date, they wouldn't have known about it immediately. Although they do run reports out of HRMS, they don't run them daily.

Mayor Scruggs asked what does HRMS stand for.

Ms. Schurhammer said Human Resource Management System. PeopleSoft is the financial end and HRMS keeps track of the people end of it. They rely on the information that is in that system. The responsibility for that system for inputting the information and insuring it is accurate falls within the Human Resources department.

Mayor Scruggs said so then if the moves were made, and she thought Ms. Schurhammer was leading up to surmising that the moves were made after the May 1st date of the HRMS that she used to build the budget book?

Ms. Schurhammer said she believed that is what happened. She would have to go back and pull the records to verify that.

Mayor Scruggs said so let's assume that happened. At what point, then, would budget find out there are now 3.5 more FTEs in water and sewer than there were. When would you have found that out?

Ms. Schurhammer said she could not pinpoint a date.

Mayor Scruggs asked would it be before you prepared the next budget book, when you were doing payroll and you said there's more people over here than what we had in the budget?

Ms. Schurhammer said by the time they did the following year's budget book, we would have known. More than likely, it would have been sometime later in the summer or early fall. Usually, they do checks then on staffing. She said at the time there were a lot of positions that needed to be eliminated. They assumed those positions were going to be eliminated as of July 1st. Some positions did not become vacant until after July 1st. It was very complicated and they were trying to work with the HR director at that time, trying to keep everything straight, and it was quite confusing. She said she knows this is not an acceptable answer, but it was the reality at the time.

Mayor Scruggs said she believed she'd cut off Councilmember Alvarez with her comments, so she would go to her next.

Councilmember Alvarez asked about the forms used.

Ms. Schurhammer explained they were personnel action forms. She said the forms were being used but budget did not get a copy of them.

Councilmember Alvarez said they have always had those form and with any change the forms had to be sent to Human Resources.

Ms. Schurhammer said they have worked something out so now when HR gets those forms, they call budget to make sure that the proposed action is feasible.

Councilmember Martinez commented said they have beaten this issue to death because they have been talking about it for a long time. He said there are new things that have come up, but he said now there is a procedure in place to correct it; there has been talk about doing an audit which will probably happen. He said that will answer a lot of questions.

Mayor Scruggs said she remained in disagreement with Councilmember Martinez.

Councilmember Martinez said the Mayor can disagree all she wanted.

Mayor Scruggs said she understands that. She didn't believe we have beat this to death. This is new information that is coming out tonight.

Councilmember Martinez said the Mayor has her opinion and he has his.

Mayor Scruggs said and that's exactly right and that is how she started it. So, this all took place, Ms. Schurhammer didn't know. It went over to water and sewer, but she didn't recognize any salary savings in the departments they came from. Nothing showed up in budget to peak budget's interest that there were salary savings now because these people were gone.

Ms. Schurhammer said that did occur and that is what caused them to go back and run some reports. She said the first couple of months in the fiscal year, the salary savings are relatively insignificant and it is not until several pay periods later that you begin to see the salary savings, and that is probably when they discovered it.

Mayor Scruggs she believed that's all the rehashing. Mayor Scruggs asked Mr. Tindall do you have an answer to my question.

Mr. Tindall said her question was can the Ordinance be amended. He said a motion could be made to amend the Ordinance prior to the motion to pass the Ordinance.

Mayor Scruggs said so we would have the Ordinance read and then the motion to amend it. Is that the appropriate way.

Mr. Tindall said he thought the title of the Ordinance should be changed and if the motion passed, then a motion for amendment might be best and see if that passes and then alter the title of the Ordinance so in the future, they can see the amendment reflected in the title as well.

Mayor Scruggs asked is that something that should be done from the dais here tonight or go back to staff or first she had to propose a motion and see if there is majority support. Is that correct?

Mr. Tindall said if she wanted to amend the motion. He said the other thing that can be done, which would give them time to reflect on the language, is to have direction to bring back to Council the transfer of funds to repay water and sewer. He said that could be done by a voice vote and then this Ordinance wouldn't have to be amended at all.

Mayor Scruggs said but there would be no way to secure any knowledge of whether there is consensus, majority approval of repaying the fund by doing it the way Mr. Tindall was talking about?

Mr. Tindall said the majority of Council could give direction.

It was moved by Scruggs, and seconded by Knaack, to make a motion that staff be directed to determine the amount of money that was paid from the water and sewer fund for the employees that should have been paid out of the general fund, and to bring back to Council, a Resolution authorizing the transfer of those funds. Members voting "nay": Alvarez. Motion carried.

ORDINANCE NO. 2830 NEW SERIES, AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING TRANSFERS OF APPROPRIATION AUTHORITY WITHIN THE WATER AND SEWER FUND TO THE GENERAL FUND IN THE ADOPTED FISCAL YEAR 2012-2013 BUDGET.

It was moved by Clark, and seconded by Frate, to table the item. Councilmembers voting "aye": Alvarez, Clark, Hugh, Knaack, Martinez, Frate and Scruggs. The motion carried unanimously.

Mr. Tindall said the actions are for Council to bring back both the Ordinance and the direction is also to bring back the appropriate action to Council to repay the water and sewer fund from the general fund for the amount expended for the 3.5 employees.

Mayor Scruggs said yes from the initial time to the present.

17. FISCAL YEAR 2012-13 BUDGET AMENDMENTS – RISK MANAGEMENT TRUST FUND

PRESENTED BY: Sherry Schurhammer, Executive Director, Financial Services

ORDINANCE: 2831

This is a request for City Council to waive reading beyond the title and adopt an ordinance approving an operating cash transfer from the General Fund (GF) to the Risk Management Trust Fund (RMTF); and the transfer of three Full Time Employees (FTEs), and the associated appropriation authority, from the RMTF to the GF, both of which are within the Human Resources and Risk Management Department.

Ms. Schurhammer said this issue was discussed at the December 4th workshop. The operating cash transfer of \$489,000 from the general fund to the risk management trust fund is required to repay the fund for the salaries charged to it in FY11 and FY12. The transfer of the 3 FTEs and the associated appropriation authority from the risk fund to the general fund for FY13 is required to fix the funding source for FY13 and beyond. The transfers to accomplish this will be between two separate funds, but within the same department. Glendale's total appropriation authority across all funds remains unchanged and the recommendation is to waive reading beyond the title and adopt an Ordinance for a cash transfer from the general fund to the risk management fund, as well as a transfer of 3.0 FTEs in the associated appropriation authority from the risk fund to the general fund.

Councilmember Clark said they have thoroughly discussed this and they gave direction on these actions at the end of the workshop meeting.

Mayor Scruggs said she would like to ask a question. In background summary, it says the FY2012 ending budget basis fund balance for the risk management trust fund is \$2.9 million, exceeding the 55% confidence level identified in the April 2012 actuarial report. Can you tell us what the confidence level is?

Ms. Schurhammer said she has the information and she could send it by email.

Mayor Scruggs asked do you remember if it was exceeding it by 1% or maybe 5%, 10%, do we have a buffering there?

Ms. Schurhammer said she thought they had a few hundred thousand dollars as a buffer.

Mayor Scruggs said what would that mean out of \$2.9 million?

Ms. Schurhammer said \$290,000 is 1%.

Mayor Scruggs asked so we were at 56%?

Ms. Schurhammer said she believed the 55% confidence level was \$2.2 million, but she would need to verify that.

Councilmember Clark said recently there was another risk management report and she thought the confidence level was now about 60%.

Mayor Scruggs said there are two members of the public who wish to speak so maybe you can find it real quick while they are speaking. Before you go away, are there any other questions.

Ken Jones, an Ocotillo resident, said no one wants to admit what went on and everyone is innocent. They were told improper funds were taken from the risk management fund, and now the City is going to transfer lots of money back into the fund. He wanted to know how the City is putting the money back. He said the City reserve had over \$70 million in it a short time ago, and now it has been reported the City is \$20 million in the red. He said it is disgusting the way IOUs are being passed around, because the City does not have the money. He said everything the Council does ends up robbing and hurting the citizens. The taxpayers don't have anything else to give.

Arthur Thruston, a Cactus resident, first welcomed Councilmember Hugh to the Council. He said he has been listening and asked who is at fault. He said when a business is run; the people that are responsible are sitting in the chairs right now. He said the City has hired management, department heads to do a job and the responsibility starts here. He spoke to Mr. Weiers and said he will have the responsibility and it will be his fault if it fails and his win if he succeeds. He said he wants answers and audits of every department to look at everything.

Ms. Schurhammer said the 55% confidence level based on the 2012 actuarial report for risk fund is \$2 million. The budget basis ending fund balance is \$2.9 million. There is a cushion of about 3%.

Mayor Scruggs asked how do we build it higher? She knew we didn't have any claims against risk management, but how else does it get bigger?

Ms. Schurhammer said every year they determine what the contribution levels are and will set the contribution level at \$2 million for FY14. A new actuarial report will come out at the end of April 2013 and if it calls for a 55% confidence level, funding that is more than \$2 million; they will have to go back to Council with a new funding plan.

Mayor Scruggs said she'd learned this risk management trust fund, which is something Ms. Schurhammer understands better, can drop below 55%. However, if the city has significant claims that have to be paid out of the fund, was she understanding that correctly?

Ms. Schurhammer said she was not certain and they would have to ask the manager of the fund.

Councilmember Clark said the city doesn't know the extent of the claims and last year there were many claims that drew down the fund, in addition to finding other irregularities. They had always maintained a confidence level of 70% to 90%. It was a combination of extraordinary claims plus finding out the money had been used inappropriately that drew it down to 55%. She said it will go back up again.

Mayor Scruggs said the funding is adjusted to build it up so there is a buffer so if claims come in again at a high level, there is something there, because if it appears it is not left with enough of a

cushion to pay the claims, then you have to have these big transfers later on to bring it back to the required confidence level.

Councilmember Clark said we don't have a history of transferring a lot of general fund money into the risk management. We do have a history of taking money out of risk management for other purposes, but typically we have always had risk management well-funded.

Ms. Schurhammer said at one point that fund balance was about \$8 million so it was quite high, even though the required funding level was significantly less.

ORDINANCE NO. 2831 NEW SERIES, AN ORDINANCE OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, AUTHORIZING AN OPERATING CASH TRANSFER; AND AUTHORIZING TRANSFERS OF APPROPRIATION AUTHORITY FOR THE RISK MANAGEMENT TRUST FUND IN THE ADOPTED FISCAL YEAR 2012-2013 BUDGET.

It was moved by Councilmember Clark, and seconded by Vice Mayor Frate, to pass, adopt and approve Ordinance No. 2831 New Series. Motion carried on a roll call vote, with the following Councilmembers voting "aye": Alvarez, Clark, Hugh, Knaack, Martinez, Frate, and Scruggs. Members voting "nay": none. The motion carried unanimously.

18. WORKERS' COMPENSATION TRUST FUND CASH TRANSFER (NO ORDINANCE REQUIRED)

PRESENTED BY: Sherry Schurhammer, Executive Director, Financial Services

This is a request for City Council to consider and approve Fiscal Year (FY) 2012-13 budget amendments related to the Workers' Compensation Trust Fund (WCTF).

Ms. Schurhammer said for FY13, as of the end of the calendar year, a transfer of cash up to \$1.4 million from those funds that currently pay into the workers' comp trust fund, is required to maintain the reserve requirement at the end of this calendar year as established by the Arizona Industrial Commission. During the 4th quarter of this fiscal year, the transfer will be reversed and unused appropriation authority will be transferred to departments to accommodate the increased requirements for the workers' comp trust fund. The City's total appropriation authority across all funds remains unchanged and the recommendation is to consider and approve FY13 budget amendments related to the transfer of cash between funds for the workers' compensation trust fund.

Councilmember Clark said the Arizona Industrial Commission used to work on a fiscal year basis and they switched to a calendar year basis. When they did that, the City's accounting process did not work. That is why the transfer has to be made, because of the movement from a fiscal year accrual basis to a calendar year accrual basis. Once that has been accomplished, the fund can be reviewed on a calendar basis and can transfer the appropriate amounts back into the general fund as required.

Mayor Scruggs said well, but then it is still not back to, we've known about it for a year or two. We are taking care of it. We are doing it right, because it has to be done within the next 20 days.

Councilmember Alvarez asked what the date was that Ms. Schurhammer found out about this, changing to a calendar year.

Ms. Schurhammer said the Industrial Commission changed to a calendar basis as of the end of calendar year 2011. It became effective over a year ago and the City is doing the transfer to calendar year 2012 with the appropriate fund balance based on the April 2012 actuarial report.

Councilmember Alvarez asked the Mayor if she got a letter or if HR received a letter from the Industrial Commission because the City was red flagged.

Mr. Brown said the Human Resources department has been in contact with the Industrial Commission all along, as is required, to inform them if the City workers' comp trust fund falls below the confidence level. They know the City's status and know of the presentation this evening and they are awaiting the result.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if a letter was sent advising the City they were below the level.

Mr. Brown said they had been notified about that. He said the City did not wait for the Industrial Commission to send the notification; the City has been proactive about communicating with them up front.

Councilmember Alvarez said Mr. Brown was not the director or interim director when the letter was received.

Mr. Brown said he has been interim director since February of 2012.

Councilmember Alvarez said this was in effect in 2011.

Mr. Brown said that is when the change was made.

Councilmember Alvarez asked what month the notification was received.

Mr. Brown said he did not recall.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if the Industrial Commission notified them that they were below.

Mr. Brown said he had not seen that, but was aware of what Councilmember Alvarez was talking about and that would have been back in the time she was referring to.

Mayor Scruggs said during our workshop last Tuesday, the answer was given that the Industrial Commission made this change in 2010 and if I understood Ms. Schurhammer correctly, she said it went into December 31, 2011.

Mr. Brown said it was 2011 and that might have been announced in 2010, but Ms. Schurhammer was correct when that went into place.

Mayor Scruggs asked did we adhere to the calendar year requirement in 2011, or did we ignore it.

Mr. Brown said the City adhered to that. He said in the past, this had been done by funding the workers' comp trust fund via transfer from the risk management trust fund to insure that the confidence level was met.

Mayor Scruggs said so this is not something new that we didn't know about.

Mr. Brown said the funding mechanism now needs to be different.

Mayor Scruggs said is the city now going to be right at the 55% confidence level?

Mr. Brown said with this transfer of the \$1.4 million, based on the information he had from the November 30th balance, which was approximately \$3.2 million, this would put the City at \$4.6 million, which is over the requirement of \$4.2 million.

Councilmember Clark said as the economy allows the payments by departments will be adjusted and there will be rate changes.

Mayor Scruggs said there is no room in the general fund to build up the payments to the level they should be because the general fund is trying to provide services and the previous solution was to go take it from over here and use it over there, and then we didn't have to worry about it. Somehow or other, she guessed the Industrial Commission found out about this.

Mayor Scruggs commented she was informed by both Councilmember Clark and Mr. Brown that the city self-reported about this. The Industrial Commission then sent a letter confirming what the City had told them. That is the red flag letter that everyone is talking about. Councilmember Clark said the City has been working with the Industrial Commission and they are fully aware of what the situation is the proposed action and they will be notified if the action is taken tonight.

Mayor Scruggs said and so the audit that was done, the internal audit, is what drew attention to the fact of the solution to the calendar year problem was to take the money from a fund that had extra money and so that is what is being corrected at this time, and stopped.

Mr. Brown said yes.

Arthur Thruston, a Cactus resident, who had submitted a speaker card, passed on speaking.

It was moved by Councilmember Knaack, and seconded by Councilmember Clark, to approve the recommended action. The motion carried unanimously.

RESOLUTIONS

19. INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA WORKERS' COMPENSATION EXEMPTION

PRESENTED BY: Jim Brown, Interim Executive Director, Human Resources & Risk Management

RESOLUTION: 4633

This is a request for City Council to waive reading beyond the title and adopt a resolution authorizing the City Manager to request an exemption from the requirement by the Industrial Commission of Arizona to post a security deposit for City of Glendale's self-insured workers' compensation claims in calendar year 2013.

Mr. Brown said the Industrial Commission requires self-insured employers to annually post financial security for claim liabilities. The Industrial Commission revised the rules in March of 2005 to exempt public entities from posting financial security provided a certified statement signed by the governing body is provided annually to the Industrial Commission prior to January 1st of each year. The certified statement must state funds are sufficient to pay liabilities for workers' compensation claims. This is accomplished through a Resolution adopted by Council and submitted to the Industrial Commission. By adopting this Resolution, the City is not required to provide a security deposit to the Industrial Commission.

Councilmember Alvarez had a copy of a document done by a previous Risk Manager and this was introduced to HR for the Council to pass. She said the Council was not aware that this should have been presented to the Council. She said that this should not be turned down by management and the Council should be advised that this was presented to the City. This was introduced to management, but management never did anything about that.

Mayor Scruggs asked is there anybody here who has knowledge of this.

Mr. Skeete said this Resolution is required every year to be presented and approved by the City Council, certifying that the City either has the funds or the deposit will have to be made. He said it has been presented to Council every year for an action.

Councilmember Alvarez said she would provide Mr. Skeete with a copy. She said this was done by the previous risk manager.

Councilmember Clark asked what amount of money the City would have to come up with if this Resolution does not pass.

Mr. Brown said the Industrial Commission would require a deposit of approximately \$3.9 million and the claims would have to be funded as they come in.

Mayor Scruggs said she couldn't remember exactly where, but she thought it is in something that Ms. MacLeod wrote, that talks about an Ordinance that had been presented for consideration and refused or declined by management, but she doesn't remember the purpose of that Ordinance. She would have to go back through her memos and her writings, but she had read that sometime

in the last week or so. She asked Mr. Skeete, if he could think of what else it might be. It was an Ordinance that was recommended, but was never moved forward to the Council.

Mr. Skeete said in creating the action plan to the audit, they discovered a recommendation from the previous risk manager, Mr. Jim Lowe, that a recommendation be brought to the City Council to amend the risk management Ordinance to charge fees for the risk management fees. That was the recommendation that was not brought forward. Council was provided copies of that recommendation in the back up material last week.

RESOLUTION NO. 4633 NEW SERIES, A RESOLUTION OF THE COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF GLENDALE, MARICOPA COUNTY, ARIZONA, REQUESTING EXEMPTION FROM THE REQUIREMENT BY THE INDUSTRIAL COMMISSION OF ARIZONA TO POST SECURITY FOR THE CITY OF GLENDALE'S SELF-INSURED WORKERS' COMPENSATION CLAIMS.

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Martinez, to pass, adopt and approve Resolution No. 4633 New Series. The motion carried unanimously.

REQUEST FOR FUTURE WORKSHOP AND EXECUTIVE SESSION

It was moved by Vice Mayor Frate, and seconded by Councilmember Knaack, to hold a City Council Workshop at 1:30 p.m. in Room B-3 of the City Council Chambers on Tuesday, December, 18th, 2012, to be followed by an Executive Session pursuant to A.R.S. 38-431.03, and to vacate the regularly scheduled City Council Meeting on Tuesday, December 25, 2012 and the regularly scheduled City Council Workshop on Tuesday, January 1, 2013, due to scheduled City holidays. The motion carried unanimously.

CITIZEN COMMENTS

Andrew Marwick, a Phoenix resident, said there will be new faces on City Council in about three weeks. He said it will be a different Council since Mayor Scruggs will be gone after 20 years. There are still a lot of problems for the City to clean up. He discussed the Coyotes and said City matters get pushed back when Coyotes issues come up. He talked about the NHL lockout and the possibility of the season being cancelled. He said he was at Westgate last weekend and it was very busy. He said Westgate will survive without the Coyotes. He said the Coyotes issue will have to be dealt with by the new Council and the City cannot afford to spend the money.

Ken Jones, an Ocotillo resident, extended a welcome to Councilmember Hugh. He spoke of a report card for the Council on their performance this past year. He spoke about water bills being up 80%. He said the Council used tax money to refurbish a building for the Bechtel Corporation way out west. He said this emptied a large building up on Bell Road and that building is being foreclosed on. He said the Council's report card should be an "F" minus.

Arthur Thruston, a Cactus resident, said there are many people who know where Arizona is due to the Powerball Winner in Fountain Hills. He talked about the casino at 95th Avenue and Northern. He asked that the new City Council quit wasting millions of dollars and apply it to

employees' paychecks and City services. He asked the new Council to build the casino to bring in business. He said a lot of money woes await the new Mayor, Mr. Weiers. He talked about the NHL being broke. He said he likes hockey, but they should pay their own way. He talked about the City's bond rating being lowered. He said businesses are supposed to pay for themselves.

COUNCIL COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

Councilmember Hugh said it was nice to be back serving with the Mayor.

Councilmember Alvarez suggested that the meeting be started with comments from the floor. She thinks citizens should be allowed to speak first, before the meeting. She commented also on the Boards and Commissions where Councilmembers sit on several boards. She said this should be reviewed and Councilmember shouldn't sit on boards or commissions. She is happy the Council is in agreement to hire a forensic, independent auditor, but the City can save money by not hiring a lawyer. She thinks the present lawyer we have should be looking for an auditor to do an audit. They need someone who is impartial and who has never worked for the City. Councilmember Alvarez also commented about the attendees at the Council meetings. She believed everyone should be allowed to come into the meetings and express their opinions, even though they don't live in Glendale. Councilmember Alvarez also addressed rumors that she is resigning in January. She is going to finish her term. She is here to support and represent the employees of the City 100%.

Councilmember Clark wished everyone a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year.

Vice Mayor Frate also wished everyone a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year. He asked everyone to be generous as many needy people are served by the Salvation Army. He reminded everyone to watch children around water.

Councilmember Martinez wished everyone a joyous and happy holiday season.

Councilmember Knaack wished everyone a Merry Christmas and a Happy New Year. She reiterated Vice Mayor Frate's comments about the Salvation Army and the food banks.

Mayor Scruggs said Councilmember Hugh, thank you for the nice comment. It is amazing, isn't it, twenty years later, but it is good to serve with you also. She would save her Merry Christmas for another week. There is a meeting a week from now and she didn't know how Merry Christmas we will be after we have that meeting, so she would hold it. She thanked everybody on the staff that put together the reception out in the lobby this evening. She had thought who in the world is going to show up at five o'clock and the reporter from the Arizona Republic said he stopped counting at 350 people. To everybody who showed up and made the time to come down at that awkward time of 5 p.m. on Tuesday, thank you very, very much. Thank you, Mr. Skeete for assigning people to organize the reception. Good evening, everybody, the meeting is adjourned.

ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 10:16 p.m.

Pamela Hanna

Pamela Hanna - City Clerk