



**MINUTES OF THE
Special Workshop – City Council Retreat
City of Glendale, Arizona
Council Chambers - Workshop Room – B-3
5850 West Glendale Avenue
Thursday, February 21, 2013
8:00 a.m. – 5:00 p.m.**

PRESENT: Mayor Jerry P. Weiers, Vice Mayor Yvonne J. Knaack and Councilmembers Ian Hugh, Manuel D. Martinez, Gary D. Sherwood, Norma S. Alvarez and Samuel U. Chavira

ALSO PRESENT: Horatio Skeete, Acting City Manager; Jamsheed Mehta, Interim Assistant City Manager; Craig Tindall, City Attorney; and Pamela Hanna, City Clerk

Meeting Call to Order - Mayor Jerry P. Weiers

Overview of Session - Dick Bowers, President of R. A. Bowers & Associates

Mr. Bowers reviewed his background and qualifications. He spoke about the three components of the session, which would be updates from staff, council strategies and goals and staff presentations. He suggested some guidelines which included to stay at the policy level, discuss tough issues and not get bogged down, be clear about initiatives you want to achieve, identify the next steps and enjoy the day.

Acting City Manager's Update - Horatio Skeete

Mr. Skeete asked Ms. Schurhammer to start the morning by presenting an overview of the fund elements and an overview of the trends, as well as the sales tax trends. He said there would also be an overview of three or four service areas. He hoped to get the council's priorities as they begin putting together the budget for next fiscal year.

Revenue Summary/Trends of Revenue Sources - Sherry Schurhammer

Ms. Schurhammer first discussed the major sources of revenue for the general fund. The city sales tax is the major source of revenue in the general fund. She said this is also the largest revenue stream in the general fund that council has the authority to change. She said state-shared revenue makes up about one-third of the budget. She said these funds are based on population and as other cities grow, Glendale's portion of these funds declines. This happened after the 2010 census because the population dropped as a percentage of the whole. Almost 61 percent of all general fund revenue comes just from city and state sales tax. The "all other" category includes license fees, development fees, and some Parks, Recreation and Library revenue. The primary property tax rate revenue is used in the general fund.

Ms. Schurhammer next discussed city sales tax. The information provided excluded the city sales tax generated at the Arena, Westgate, the Stadium and Zanjero businesses. The sales tax collected at these locations is deposited to specifically address the debt service for the area. Sales tax grew from 2003 through 2007, and grew about \$5 million dollars per year during that time. During the recession, the city sales tax declined 21 percent over a couple of years. Growth has been slow since the recession ended. The amount collected in FY12 is the same amount that was collected in FY05.

Ms. Schurhammer said in the current fiscal year, they built the budget based on an anticipated \$23 million extra due to the sales tax increase. After the budget was adopted in early June, council adopted a modification at the end of June removing the increase in sales tax from major purchases. The city was expecting to lose \$1.1 million out of the \$23 million originally expected. At the time council adopted that rate, they also brought forward \$1.1 million in reductions. She said growth for the future is 3.5 percent per year, which is a higher rate of growth than in the last couple of years. She said they are anticipating better economic activity in the future, just not as good as before the recession hit. She said there will be an estimated drop off of about \$20 million from FY17 to FY18 and that comes with the expiration of the temporary sales tax rate.

Mr. Skeete clarified Ms. Schurhammer's statement about the general sales tax rate at 1.9 percent. He said the graph presented represents the 1.2 percent rate before it was increased by .7 percent.

Ms. Schurhammer discussed state shared revenue and said this revenue is based on the city's population share. Prior to the census, Glendale was just under 5 percent of the state's total population. After the census, the population declined, so the city's portion of the state shared revenue declined.

Questions were asked by Mayor Weiers and Councilmember Sherwood regarding state shared revenue and the amounts diverted, which Ms. Schurhammer answered.

Councilmember Martinez asked about sales tax projections and Ms. Schurhammer said sales tax projections are where they think the city will end up at the end of this fiscal year based on what they have collected so far.

Ms. Schurhammer said state shared revenue collections in 2012 on \$44 million dropped to a level last experienced in 2004. She said this is significant because the city sales tax with state shared revenue make up about three-fourths of the city's general fund revenue budget. This has a significant impact for the city on expenditures. She said FY12 collections were about the same collected in FY04 or FY05. For FY12, state sales tax makes up about 40 percent of the total state shared revenue the city received in FY12. The city received less in state shared sales tax in 2012 than was received in 2004. The city does not receive any portion of the state temporary sales tax. She said state income tax is a large portion of the state shared revenue and was about 44 percent of the total if FY12. These funds lag by two years, so what was received in 2012, when they reached the bottom, was what the state collected in 2010 in the midst of the recession.

Ms. Schurhammer then discussed the motor vehicle in-lieu is the smallest component of state shared revenue. The funds collected in FY12 are 15 percent less than what was collected in 2003. The declining numbers have shown that consumers have changed their behavior over the last ten years. Consumers and business are retaining their vehicles much longer and are driving fewer miles. Since the vehicle license tax is based on the value of the vehicle, revenue has

declined, despite population growth because the value of the vehicles has declined as they have aged.

Ms. Schurhammer said primary property tax and SRP in lieu is a very tiny portion of revenue. She said the statutory limit in 2012 was \$2.97 million and the city collected less than that. She said the amount collected in FY12 was less than what was collected in FY04. Part of this was caused by the drop in assessed valuation.

Ms. Schurhammer discussed development fee revenue, which may be commercial, industrial or residential. Fees include building permits, plan check fees, zoning fees, right of way permits, fire, traffic review engineering inspection fees and barricade fees. These are fees charged by the departments to provide those services. Building permit revenue is the largest portion of this revenue. Plan check revenue is the next largest portion of the revenue. Development fee revenue peaked in 2006 at just over \$7 million. Much of the development occurred in the Westgate and Zanjero area. Many of the construction projects were done due to the Super Bowl which was held in the city in 2008. Revenue spiked again in 2008 when the city hosted the Super Bowl, not only due to inspections of temporary structures related to the Super Bowl, but for projects such as Banner Thunderbird's renovation of their facility and Midwestern University's new optometry and dental clinics. She said a new fee schedule was adopted by Council, which is adjusted annually by the Consumer Price Index. This revenue category is volatile, so they look at their lowest numbers as their baseline and try to consider any excess collected as one time revenue.

Councilmember Martinez said the legislation put limits on impact fees. He asked Ms. Schurhammer if she knew what impact that has had on the city with respect to the revenues. Ms. Schurhammer said the impact fee revenue does not show up in the general fund. She said it can only be used for construction projects. Councilmember Sherwood said since there hasn't been much development, they probably don't have much history to see what has happened with these.

Mr. Skeete said the fees eligible for collection was reduced by about 50 percent. He said they are in the process of completing a new impact fee study which will be brought forward soon.

Councilmember Martinez said inspectors are doing about 13 inspections per day and it is difficult for them to keep that up.

Mr. Skeete said the low year for housing starts was probably 2010. He said they are on track this year to do even more than last year.

Ms. Schurhammer next discussed city franchise fee revenue for gas, electric and cable fees that are paid to the city for using the right of way for its fiber optic and other transmission lines. Although the revenue peaked in 2008, it has declined slightly and seems to have leveled off, despite rate increases. She said this was due to a lot of vacant properties and changing consumer choices, especially related to cable TV companies.

Mayor Weiers asked if the franchise fees included telephone. Ms. Schurhammer said it was not included.

Ms. Schurhammer said license and fee revenue was another catch all category like the development fees. She said there are over a dozen fees in this category. These include Parks, Recreation and Library for programs and classes, the Fire Department, which collects fees through its partnership with Southwest Ambulance and its fire inspection program, and Sales

Tax, for licenses. The most revenue collected is for sales tax license fees which are about \$600-\$700,000 a year.

Court revenue includes many different fees and fines. Much of this revenue is remitted to the state. There is a decline in revenue due to an overall reduction in case filings since 2008.

Ms. Schurhammer then switched from the general fund to the designated sales tax funds. The original public safety sales tax was adopted by voters in 1994 at one-tenth of a cent. This was increased in the 2007 election. Collection began in December of 2007, so the figures increased. Two thirds of the revenue is allocated to police and one-third is allocated to fire. The revenue is used for additional personnel, equipment and operations expenses. The temporary sales tax increase does not apply to the public safety sales tax or the transportation sales tax. The public safety sales tax retains revenue generated by Westgate, the Stadium and Zanjero.

The transportation sales tax was approved by voters in a 2001 election. This is used for intersection improvements and street projects, as well as a variety of other things. The temporary rate that went into effect in August does not apply to this portion of the designated sales tax. This performs differently than the general fund city sales tax because it retains revenue generated at Westgate, the stadium and Zanjero. This does include food for home consumption so it did perform differently than the public safety sales tax.

Ms. Schurhammer next talked about HURF Revenue (Highway User Revenue Fees). This fee includes a portion of the vehicle license tax. This is not based on the price of gas, but based on the volume of gas sold. There are fewer vehicles being driven and less gas used as well as more fuel efficient vehicles.

The two most significant revenue sources for the general fund, the city sales tax and state shared revenue, has shown that the FY12 collection are the same as collections received in FY04 and FY05. The services that are supported by these revenues now cost more than they did in 2004 and 2005. Additionally, there are costs associated with opening new facilities. There are more Parks & Recreation facilities and Police and Fire facilities as well as the Media Convention Center.

Ms. Schurhammer discussed general fund expenditures. The general fund is the largest fund in the operating budget. It funds the majority of services provided to the community, outside of the enterprise funds. There are three main components of the general fund budget, operating, transfers and pay as you go capital. Of the 80 percent operating budget, over three-fourths is related to salary-related expenses. The rest of this includes non-salary items, such as vehicle costs and contractual services such as landscape maintenance, third party collections and animal control. There is also a required category which includes insurance premiums, workers' comp and risk as well as replacement fund contributions. Within the general fund operating budget, the three largest sections are Police, Fire and Parks, Recreation and Libraries.

General fund transfers make up about 19 percent of the general fund budget. The components of that are arena operations, stadium operations and Municipal Property Corporation debt service (MPC debt). Although this budget is just under \$30 million, in future years, the amount will be \$30 million plus range. This varies due to the debt service. Councilmember Knaack asked about the debt service figures on the arena and Camelback Ranch. Ms. Schurhammer did not have the exact figures with her. Ms. Schurhammer also discussed stadium operations and the all other category, which included the airport, civic center and public housing.

Councilmember Alvarez asked if attorney's fees and consultant fees would fall under the City Attorney. Ms. Schurhammer said there was money allocated in the City Attorney budget for outside legal fees. She said there is a budget in Economic Development to do an economic development study. In prior years, there were legal fees charged related to Economic Development activity. She said she doesn't believe this is happening currently, but would have to check.

Mr. Tindall explained it depended on what the legal fees were being incurred for. If the fees are being incurred for Economic Development, they would probably be paid out of the Economic Development account. Councilmember Alvarez asked why legal fees for the casino would be for Economic Development. Mr. Tindall said he would have to see what the fees were for, but there have been economic analyses done regarding the proposed reservation. Councilmember Alvarez said it was quite a bit of money in that account for Economic Development and she would like an explanation. She said the funds were listed as consultant fees and she would like to know what the fees were for. Mr. Tindall said a record of how those funds were spent could be reviewed and made available. He said the documents Councilmember Alvarez is looking at may not have the detail, but the detailed information is available at her request. Mr. Tindall said he would work with the other departments and make the information available. Councilmember Alvarez said she was very interested in all the consultant fees and wanted to know where the money went to. She wanted to know why the lawyer received \$3 million dollars. Mr. Tindall said they would provide an explanation of what the firm was hired to do.

Mayor Weiers called for a break.

Overview of Department Services and Significant Accomplishments - Staff Presentations

Mr. Kent spoke about Community Services Group. He provided a brief summary of the functions of the following departments: Community and Economic Development, Marketing and Communications, Neighborhood and Human Services, Parks, Recreation and Libraries, Public Works, Transportation, and Water Services. There were no questions from Mayor and Council.

Mr. Murphy spoke about the Internal Services Group. He provided a brief summary of the functions of the following departments: Financial Services, Human Resources and Risk Management and Technology and Innovation.

Vice Mayor Knaack asked if the Innovate program was still ongoing and if there were any ongoing projects. Mr. Murphy said there were projects in the works and they continue to apply the Lean process to them.

Councilmember Martinez said he was getting complaints about the billing system from his constituents. He asked if there were any issues with this program, other than staffing issues. Mr. Murphy said the utility billing system is complex and is used by several municipalities across the nation. Due to the size of the system, there are a lot of weekly updates, but he wasn't sure if that was contributing to the problem. He said it is not normal practice to have so many updates. They are working with the vendor to try and reduce the number of updates.

Vice Mayor Knaack said she and other Councilmembers have experienced problems personally with the system and have also gotten complaints from their constituents about the way the system works and how the checks are handled. Mr. Murphy explained that they continued to work with the vendor to resolve the problems that arise with the system.

Mayor Weiers asked if Mr. Murphy was familiar with systems that allow citizens to communicate via computer with the City Council to voice their opinions. Mr. Murphy said if there is a willingness to use the technology, the IT department can install it. The issue is funding. Mayor Weiers said the city is way behind technologically and should be using computers instead of books at this point. Mayor Weiers asked Mr. Murphy to do some research into this and bring him some cost figures.

Vice Mayor Knaack said the ipads were not hard to learn and the other Councilmembers should be using them.

Councilmember Sherwood asked if the billing issue was with the online bill pay through the city website. Vice Mayor Knaack said it was timeliness. Mr. Murphy said it was the actual posting time of the revenue that comes in. Discussion was held about waiting times on the phone and the timing waiting message. Mr. Murphy said how long a person was waiting on the phones was a staffing issue. Mayor Weiers suggested they add a prompt in the system giving customers the option of calling at a time that is less busy. Councilmember Sherwood confirmed that the issues customers were experiencing had nothing to do with paying their bill online. There was further discussion about the wait times on the phones.

Mr. Skeete invited Ms. Schurhammer to speak about some of the issues. She explained the billing process. The city sends out about 60,000 bills per month. She said only about 9,500 are on e-pay. She said they can't force people to utilize e-pay. She said customer can pay their bill through the mail, come into the city offices or pay it through the bank. When it is paid through the bank, the bank sends the city a check, so the checks have to be processed. She said due to staffing issues, they may not get all the checks opened the day they arrive. She said there are daily postings of all revenue that comes in. There are only 6 people answering the phones and they get 10-13,000 calls a month. The staff is all cross-trained to do all the functions of the office every day and do the best they can.

Vice Mayor Knaack said she understood about the staffing issues and that the staff is doing the best they can, but they have to figure out how to do better with the customer service.

Mayor Weiers asked if there was a way to have an express lane open to get the customers with simple payments so they can move in and out quickly to alleviate some of the long wait times. Ms. Schurhammer said they do have a plan in place to deal with the lines when long. Councilmember Martinez has brought up the customer service issues in the past and he doesn't want citizens coming away with a bad perception of the city and city services.

Councilmember Sherwood confirmed that the checks received from the banks were just one check and not a large number of checks. Ms. Schurhammer said that was generally the case.

Judge Finn provided a brief summary of the functions of the City Court. There were no questions from Mayor and Council.

Chief Burdick provided a brief summary of the functions of the Fire Department.

Councilmember Chavira asked what the city's response times were. Chief Burdick explained how response times were measured and said currently they are at 6 minutes and 52 seconds. Councilmember Chavira asked how longer response time causes greater risk. at risk by having longer response times. Chief Burdick said for every minute they are not on scene, the fire size doubles. For response times regarding individuals, brain death occurs in 4 to 6 minutes, so they need to arrive prior to that. Councilmember Chavira asked Mr. Skeete how much of the money

collected from Prop 457 was going to public safety as a whole. Mr. Skeete said 60 percent of the general fund goes toward Public Safety, so 60 percent of the revenue from Prop 457 is dedicated to Public Safety.

Vice Mayor Knaack asked if response times have increased over the last few years. Chief Burdick said in 2008, they were only a few seconds away from the national standard of 5 minutes. Today, they are 1 minute 52 seconds away from that 5 minute mark. Vice Mayor Knaack asked why there was an increase in response times. Chief Burdick said due to the increase in call volume and decrease in revenue and an increase in their workload has been the cause. Vice Mayor Knaack asked how they planning to decrease the response times. Chief Burdick said they were reviewing staffing, contracts and increases in revenue. When asked about staffing, Chief Burdick said those issues would be addressed in budget talks. Vice Mayor Knaack said she supports the fire department and would like to see the Prop. 457 money get where it is needed the most.

Mayor Weiers asked about the possibility of running paramedic only vehicles to save costs. Chief Burdick said the contract with Southwest Ambulance has addressed that issue and the 2 person units are very effective. There also has been an increase in fires, so they need the additional personnel as well. He also explained that 4 person units do reduce response times. Chief Burdick said they will look at any suggestions to solve the personnel issues. Mayor Weiers also asked the possibility of having a licensed nurse on staff. Chief Burdick said he is working with Arrowhead Hospital, but won't suggest a program that requires additional funding. He said it is a program that works.

Councilmember Martinez asked how Glendale's response time compared with other cities in the Valley. Chief Burdick said some of the cities have not gone through accreditation and still use averages to calculate their times. Other cities in the valley are accredited departments and use the percentage. He said he would get the information and bring it to the council.

Chief Black provided a brief summary of the functions of the Police Department.

Vice Mayor Knaack congratulated the police department for the arrest of the Grandel gang members. She asked how many sworn officers they have now. Chief Black said they are authorized 405 sworn officer positions and currently have 391 officers. She said they have not hired any new officers since last spring. She said they have seen an increased rate of attrition. She is working with HR on academy dates and working to obtain some lateral officers.

Councilmember Sherwood asked what the response times were for the level 1 through 3 calls and how have those response times changed. Chief Black said their goal for priority 1 and 2 calls is less than 5 minutes. She said for 2012, they were below that response time. Response times for lower priority calls are less than 15 minutes, but actual time is about 21 minutes. The lowest priority calls have a response time of 35 minutes, and the goal is 30 minutes.

Mayor Weiers asked if 391 was the actual number of officers they had today. Chief Black said those were filled positions. Mayor Weiers asked what would be the peak number of officers required. Chief Black said the highest number of police officers the police department ever had was 425 officers. She said if she had all the officers she needed to do all the crime prevention functions and everything else, she would need more than 405 officers. She said they are moving from a zone deployment area to a beat deployment area in July. Chief Black talked about

increases in property crimes and their proactive work, street crime investigations and drug trafficking.

Mayor Weiers asked about the average yearly DUI arrest count 10 years ago compared to today. Chief Black said most of the DUI arrests are made by the motor officers. She said patrol officers are not as involved in those sorts of activities as they were 10 years ago. He asked about the numbers of traffic citations were lower today than they were 10 years ago. Chief Black said citation numbers were down, but so were accident rates. She said there are officers dedicated to traffic issues, but regular patrol officers are not focusing on traffic related issues.

Mayor Weiers asked how many civilian positions have been eliminated that sworn officers are now filling. Chief Black said they have not eliminated any civilian positions this year. She said they have not laid off any civilians positions in the past where sworn officers are now filling those job duties. She said two positions in Emergency Management were moved to the Fire Department. She said in the next couple of weeks, the officers being used in Detention, Records and Communications will be filled and those officers will be returned to their regular job duties.

Councilmember Sherwood said the Police Department has used overtime in the past to compensate for the staffing shortages they have. He said it seemed there was a lot of overtime as well in the specialty teams, such as SWAT and the K-9 units as there is fewer members on these teams. Chief Black said the organization is very lean at this time, but they do get the job done with the resources they have. She said it is essential they maintain the specialty units due to the entertainment district, even though other cities of a similar size might not even try.

Councilmember Alvarez asked where the DARE officers were going to be placed. Chief Black said they have identified the number of officers needed in patrol and investigations and she has since taken the two DARE officers and dedicated them to serve all the schools within their area to be liaisons to work on safety plans with the schools. She has met with the schools most concerned about the loss of the DARE program and is working with them on finding creative ways to continue to provide the services related to this program.

Councilmember Martinez asked what a beat consists of. Chief Black said the size of the beat area is based on the volume of calls. Councilmember Martinez asked about the trends of robberies and assaults. Chief Black said these types of events do tend to occur in cycles, but robberies were down 4 percent. Councilmember Martinez talked about the areas where it seemed a lot of these crimes were occurring. Chief Black said those areas were problem areas.

Councilmember Chavira commended Chief Black in participation in the multi-agency event that resulted in many arrests.

Council Strategic Goals and Objectives - Dick Bowers

Mr. Bowers spoke about talking about the undiscussables and the things we don't want to talk about. He hoped everyone could find the things they all agree on. Mr. Bowers spoke with the Mayor and all the Councilmembers and said discussed the things everyone would like to accomplish at this retreat. He said transparency was a theme repeated often. Other themes were getting information sooner, restoring things that define Glendale, communicating with the public and finding common ground. Mr. Bowers also said that communication was a goal mentioned by many members of the council. He said the council felt the greatest issues were to form a strong, communicative council, address the big issues and to complete the audit and find a firm base.

He discussed the goals adopted last year, which included strong neighborhoods, a vibrant city center and high quality service for citizens. He said this council told him that they would like to achieve a long term plan, appoint the right City Manager, get the audit done and move on and recover Glendale's sense of community.

Mr. Bowers also said the council needed to identify key strategic initiatives. He asked if Mayor Weiers would like to proceed. Mayor Weiers asked if the afternoon was going to be used to discuss key initiatives. Mr. Bowers said yes. Mayor Weiers said that staff, City Manager and City Attorney did not need to remain for the rest of the meeting.

Mr. Bowers asked the council what they would like to see as key issues. Councilmember Martinez suggested hiring the city manager was very important. Mr. Bower said that item was not as strategic as it was tactical.

Vice Mayor Knaack said the city needs to get back to basics and decide what is the role of municipal government.

Councilmember Martinez said there has been concern about the city debt and its impact on the basic services the city must provide. He would like to clarify this and develop a plan to address this. Mr. Bowers said they would have to look past the 2017 budget year.

Mayor Weiers said he has noticed a lack of cooperation between departments, almost like a competition. He said cooperation is the key to getting the job done. Vice Mayor Knaack said the council sets the tone for the standard of cooperation expected. Mayor Weiers said he has noticed that one department will encourage businesses to come to Glendale, but another department will slow the whole process down. He said everyone has to be on the same team and not competing.

Councilmember Chavira said the city has to be more organized and the city should look at the international trade zones for more aggressive economic development.

Councilmember Alvarez said they need to pay more attention to the neighborhoods and communicate more with them. She said many deals are done in executive session and these deals cost the taxpayer. The neighborhoods need to be included in the decisions. She saw the staff acting like the council works for them. The council needs to represent the district and not just certain people in the district. They need to listen to the community. Mr. Bowers clarified by asking Councilmember Alvarez if she was mostly talking about openness and transparency. She said there needs to be transparency in addressing the big items, such as hockey, the casino and Camelback Ranch.

Councilmember Hugh said visiting other cities and towns would help. He said a lot of parks in other cities are much better maintained. He said this goes back to paying attention to the neighborhoods.

Councilmember Martinez commented on the executive sessions. He said in dealing with the big issues like the arena, there are legal issues being discussed and they need guidance from an attorney. He said the big issues have to go to the public anyway. Mr. Bowers said he has worked with a lot of cities and said Glendale is one of the most strict regarding what is discussed in executive session.

Mayor Weiers said it is critical that they address public safety, with crime being up and response times down. Vice Mayor Knaack said that was the whole point of getting back to basics. The

council needs to set the tone for what they are going to do in the future, not just for next year, but for many years to come. Mayor Weiers said the mission today was to figure out what the priorities are. Councilmember Alvarez said they also need to be truthful with the people. She talked about several issues that the people and the council were not informed of.

Mr. Bowers discussed public safety and how the underlying safety of the entire community was of primary concern to the council. Mayor Weiers said the point wasn't that they were having less DUI arrests; it was that there were fewer officers out on the streets to make the arrests. There was discussion about tickets, costs to the court and speeding. Councilmember Chavira said they do need to think past 2017 and how to bring back the values. Councilmember Hugh said it should be a quiet, peaceful city that people will want to visit and raise their families in.

Councilmember Martinez said they need to restore basic services and instead of having a nice DARE program; they should keep the citizens safe. Councilmember Chavira said it is hard to keep focus on that when you have the mass shooting incidents. Vice Mayor Knaack said there might be a way to bring some of that education back into the schools because the school resource officers are in the schools anyway. Mayor Weiers said they could use volunteers acting as public school resource officers. Councilmember Chavira said Chief Black raised a good point about talking to the school boards. There was discussion about the state stepping in for some of the issues surrounding safety in the schools.

Councilmember Sherwood said the police department is not the cause of all the city's problems. He said school districts have to take more ownership when it comes to sharing the cost of school resource officers. He said they have to take care of the mandated services. Councilmember Martinez said they needed to get the arena deal done. Councilmember Sherwood said the other two priorities were to get the audit done and get a city manager. Mayor Weiers said he would like to move all the interim employees into permanent employees. He said they need to start showing more certainty with public safety.

Mr. Bowers went over the issues and said part of the problem is all the issues are very big issues and they weigh on your mind. He spoke about the different events that define the city, like the Chocolate Affaire and Glendale Glitters. Vice Mayor Knaack said they couldn't let Centerline go as the heart of the city was the downtown area. She mentioned the court. Mayor Weiers said they needed to look at how they were going to make that happen. Councilmember Martinez said they need to find a way to offer incentives to get people interested in developing the downtown area. Mayor Weiers said they could target the Centerline area with the added attraction of the new court nearby, there might be growth in this area. Discussion was held about impact fees and how to attract new businesses. Councilmember Knaack discussed setting policy so some of these ideas can be realized. Councilmember Sherwood said the Centerline Business Alliance isn't waiting for the court. He said they can't count on the court building, but need to continue to encourage growth. He said there was synergy for growth to pick up.

Mr. Bowers went over the idea of what can the city do that doesn't cost money to market the Centerline area. Councilmember Sherwood said Glendale was a bedroom community and the tax burden was on the citizens. As growth occurred, they started to build more amenities and put more tax burden on the commercial sector. He did not know if that had been put in writing at some point. He said when you are putting the tax burden on businesses; it might be hard to attract new businesses. Vice Mayor Knaack said the money is going to come from more

business as residents are not going to want to pay more property taxes. Mr. Bowers asked if it was worth looking at the 2025 study to emphasize any points.

Mr. Bowers discussed the city's slogan and asked if that was still the message the council wanted to put out to the citizens. Discussion was held about business, business development and economic growth for the city over the next few years. Councilmember Sherwood asked about strategic goals. They talked about how safety was a fundamental goal. Mayor Weiers spoke of an example of departments getting together as a group to discuss their failures as a way to brainstorm with the group to get solutions. Mr. Bowers asked if they are getting a public value that is equal to or better than the exchange of revenue.

Councilmember Sherwood said employees were watching everything the council does, but now it is affecting their day to day living, so they are very aware of what the council is doing. He said they need to have the sense that the council is working together, which helps employees all the way down the line. The employees need to feel confident in their council. Mayor Weiers said employees have a lot of good ideas on how to save the city money, but won't or can't say anything to their supervisors. He said the supervisors may not want change or the employee is afraid of the supervisor. He would like to get something going to encourage the staff to bring good ideas forward to help save time and money. Councilmember Chavira said the city of Phoenix does have a program like that and it is very effective. Councilmember Alvarez said the city used to have a program like that where the employee could get money for their suggestions. Mayor Weiers said the people that do the work will have the best ideas on how to fix the problems that exist. There was a discussion about several ideas that employees came up with that saved the city money previously. Mr. Bowers said employees love having their ideas seen and suggested inviting them to a meeting to discuss their ideas. Mayor Weiers said it would also look great in the public's eyes that the employees are trying their best to save money and make the city run more efficiently. Mr. Bowers said this would also show council's support of staff.

Councilmember Knaack said the council needs to review the 2025 plan as well as the charter. Council agreed to review both after budget discussions are completed.

Council Guidelines and Council Meeting Rules and Procedures - Dick Bowers

Mr. Bowers also brought up changes or concerns with code, council guidelines and meeting rules and procedures. Councilmember Alvarez asked a question about a notation on the Council Guidelines that they had been amended. It was discussed that a more detailed notation be added to specify which section was amended.

Councilmember Martinez said he would like to amend Section 3 and Section 4 of the City Council Guidelines regarding the monies allocated to the Councilmembers. Due to the current budget situation, he suggested the \$18,000 mentioned in section 3 be cut in half to \$9,000 and the \$15,000 mentioned in section 4 be eliminated altogether. He said the funds are nice to have, but given the current situation, the money should be given back to the general fund. Councilmember Sherwood said these are guidelines and has nothing to do with the budget. He said he doesn't want to lose the option of having this money in the future. He doesn't see a problem with the funds as a guideline, but as a budgetary item, it is excessive. Councilmember Alvarez said it depends on the district you are representing. She said she hasn't taken any money out of the \$15,000 fund. She pays for much of her expenses herself out of her own money. She represents a poor district and she would like to have this money available. Mayor Weiers suggested cutting the funds in half and putting the money in a pool and having the council voting

on how to spend it. Vice Mayor Knaack said council doesn't have to use the \$15,000. She also said in the past, they have spent considerable sums on constituent communications, but they don't need that kind of money anymore because they use email. Councilmember Hugh said if you don't use the money, it just goes back into the budget. Councilmember Sherwood said this was a very, very small portion of the budget and the money can be turned back in if it is not used. Mayor Weiers said if the money stays there, they can use it to bring back some events that have been cancelled. Consensus was to leave the money where it was for now.

There was discussion about some streets that need to be repaired in the city. Councilmember Alvarez said the people living in this area are elderly and have a hard time getting around with the streets not being paved. She has used her money in the past to get streets paved in her district.

Vice Mayor Knaack asked if they had looked at the boards and commissions to decide if they all would stay. Councilmember Martinez said they are cutting them down from 11 to 7, and possibly combining a couple of them.

Councilmember Sherwood next discussed section 8 and 9 of the City Council Guidelines. He said the fiscal year is July to June and their terms of January to December. He suggested changing the guidelines to select the Vice Mayor in December to align with the January to December terms. This would avoid the 6 month terms. Mayor Weiers suggested voting on a new Vice Mayor in November to give them a month to prepare so they are ready to take office in January. Vice Mayor Knaack suggested mid-January to mid-January after the Councilmembers are sworn in. Discussion was held and the council decided the term would be effective from the last scheduled council meeting in January for a period of one year.

Regarding section 9 of the council guidelines, Councilmember Alvarez suggested that Councilmembers should not serve on a committee for more than 2 years at a time. She felt everyone should be allowed the opportunity to serve. Discussion was held about the number of committees and how often each committee met on a regular basis. It was decided to change the guidelines, to a consecutive 2 year term.

Councilmember Sherwood said that the second paragraph of section 12, regarding supporting the city's official position, is not being followed all the time. He said if they are going to be a cohesive council, they are not always going to agree. Discussion was held about supporting the majority opinion of the council. Mr. Bowers said if a Councilmember is there to represent the city; the Councilmember will have to express the council's opinion

Mayor Weiers referenced section 11 that if a Councilmember is going to attend an event in another Councilmember's district, the visiting Councilmember should let the district's Councilmember know they will be attending. He said he has been to several events where several Councilmembers attended. Mayor Weiers said this common courtesy would show they are working together as a team.

Councilmember Martinez asked if he needed to call if he was attending an event pertaining to section 13. Vice Mayor Knaack said if everyone is invited to an event, a phone call isn't really necessary. If only one Councilmember is invited to an event, it shows the council is working together. Mr. Bowers said this is just part of mutual respect and it should be easy to do.

Councilmember Sherwood asked a question about section 14, number 2. He asked if both parties cannot agree to seek a third party for facilitation, would they proceed to number 3. Consensus was that they would move directly to number 3.

Councilmembers next discussed council meeting rules and procedures. Councilmember Sherwood said when the agenda is loaded with sensitive issues; he suggested not even giving a public comment section for non-agenda items. Councilmember Hugh agreed. Mayor Weiers asked if there had to a full council present to listen to public comment. He suggested starting at 5 p.m. for public comment, rotating three people each meeting to be at the meeting at 5 p.m., and then start the meeting at 6 p.m. Mayor Weiers said he would be one of those three people every time. Discussion was held about how many minutes to allow and the procedure to follow. Both Councilmember Alvarez and Vice Mayor Knaack said if they are going to have public comment, the entire council should be there. Council agreed to start the meetings at 6 p.m. and have public comment at the beginning of the meeting. Discussion was held about asking the citizens to state their name and address at the meeting. It was agreed to ask only for the speaker's name and district or cross streets. Councilmembers discussed clapping in the meetings.

There was also discussion of having a prayer at the beginning of the meeting. Mayor Weiers said each Councilmember would have the opportunity to invite someone from their district to attend the meeting and it will show a sense of community. Councilmember Martinez expressed his opposition to having a prayer and feels a moment of silence is sufficient. Vice Mayor Knaack said they should either a prayer or moment of silence, not both. Consensus was there would be a short prayer at the beginning of the meeting.

Retreat Wrap up – Dick Bowers

Mr. Bowers expressed his appreciation for the work the Councilmembers do. He said they will form the seeds of the policy direction and staff will support that. He said the budget is not just a book, but it turns into a primary operating document. He said the Councilmembers expressed great creativity in their discussions today and went outside the box. He said it is exciting for him to see the council work together and create something great.

The meeting was adjourned at 2:05 p.m.