

**MINUTES
CITY OF GLENDALE PLANNING COMMISSION
CITY COUNCIL CHAMBERS
5850 WEST GLENDALE AVENUE
GLENDALE, ARIZONA 85301**

**THURSDAY, FEBRUARY 4, 2016
6:00 PM**

CALL TO ORDER

The meeting was called to order at approximately 6:00 p.m.

Commissioners Present: Commissioners Arthur Dobbelaere, Rick Harper, Gary Hirsch, David Moreno, Jack Gallegos and Vice Chairperson Al Lenox and Chairperson Steve Johnston were in attendance.

City Staff Present: Tabitha Perry, Assistant Planning Director, Jon Froke, AICP, Planning Director, James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney, and Diana Figueroa, Recording Secretary.

APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Chairperson Johnston stated there were no Minutes for Approval.

WITHDRAWALS AND CONTINUANCES

Chairperson Johnston called for any withdrawals and/or continuances. There were none.

PUBLIC HEARING ITEMS

Chairperson Johnston called for staff's presentation.

Tabitha Perry, Assistant Planning Director, stated that the following two cases would be heard concurrently, however, will require separate motions.

1. **GPA15-02:** A request by Earl, Curley, and Lagarde, PC, representing Zanjero Glendale LLC, to amend the General Plan from CCC (Corporate Commerce Center) to HDR 12-20 du/ac (High Density Residential) for a project titled Zanjero Apartments. The site is located northwest of the northwest corner of 91st Avenue and Glendale Avenue (9300 West Glendale Avenue) and is in the Yucca District. Staff Contact: Tabitha Perry, Assistant Planning Director.
2. **ZON15-07:** A request by Earl, Curley, and Lagarde, PC, representing Zanjero Glendale LLC, to rezone from PAD (Planned Area Development) to PAD (Planned Area Development, Multiple Family Residential) on approximately 18 acres. The site is located northwest of the northwest corner of 91st Avenue and Glendale Avenue (9300 West Glendale Avenue) and is in the Yucca District. Staff Contact: Tabitha Perry, Assistant Planning Director.

Ms. Tabitha Perry, Assistant Planning Director, stated this was a request by Earl, Curley, and Lagarde, PC, representing Zanjero Glendale LLC, to amend the General Plan from CCC to HDR

12-20 du/ac for a project titled Zanjero Apartments. Also included is a request by Earl, Curley, and Lagarde, PC, representing Zanjero Glendale LLC, to rezone from PAD (Planned Area Development) to PAD (Planned Area Development, Multiple Family Residential) on approximately 18 acres. The site is located northwest of the northwest corner of 91st Avenue and Glendale Avenue and is in the Yucca District.

Ms. Perry said the site is located northwest of the northwest corner of 91st Avenue and Glendale Avenue and is in the Yucca District. Ms. Perry stated that approval of this request will allow for an apartment complex development on approximately 18 acres titled Zanjero Apartments. She added that the apartment complex will generally consist of 175 one bedroom units, 147 two bedroom units and 18 three bedroom units for a total of 340 units.

Ms. Perry explained that the site is vacant and is in close proximity to a Cabela's store located at the northeast corner of Glendale and 95th Avenues. She noted that if the General Plan Amendment and Rezone is granted, the applicant would develop a project titled "Zanjero Apartments." She said this proposed development will be a gated community with a main and secondary access along Zanjero Boulevard. She noted the site plan depicts a safe traffic circulation flow internal and external to the site. Building heights are proposed at a maximum height of 48 feet and details have been given to ensure some level of security between buildings as it relates to safety and lighting. She stated the applicant's proposal for a four-sided architecture design with appropriate materials and color scheme will provide a harmonious style for the proposed development and existing surrounding developments.

Ms. Perry noted that on November 12, 2015, the applicant mailed notification letters to adjacent property owners and interested parties advising of a scheduled neighborhood meeting on November 30, 2015. She said that the applicant's development team, city staff and one individual attended. The one individual, representing TNW LLC, was presented with relevant information regarding the project which included visuals of the site plan, specifics to the number of units and an anticipated project schedule for development. In addition, prior to tonight's meeting, the applicant and owner were able to enter into an agreement with the Peoria Unified School District. Thus, the school district is in support of this application.

In conclusion, Ms. Perry stated this request appears to meet the required findings. Staff recommends approval subject to the stipulations contained in the staff report.

Chairperson Johnston called for questions from the Commission. There were no questions from the Commission.

Chairperson Johnston called for the applicant to make a presentation.

Mr. Ed Bull, Applicant's representative, stated they agreed with staff's presentation and appreciate the recommendation for approval for both GPA15-02 and ZON15-07. He said they also agree with the stipulations set forth by staff. He noted that if the Commission would like, he could make a full presentation.

Chairperson Johnston asked for any additional comments or questions. There were none.

Chairperson Johnston opened the public hearing. With no one wishing to speak, he closed the public hearing.

Chairperson Johnston called for a motion.

COMMISSIONER HIRSCH MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF CASE GPA15-02. COMMISSIONER HARPER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney, stated the Planning Commission's actions are not final and the Commission's recommendation will be forwarded to City Council for further action.

VICE CHAIRPERSON LENOX MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF CASE ZON15-07. COMMISSIONER MORENO SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney, stated the Planning Commission's actions are not final and the Commission's recommendation will be forwarded to City Council for further action.

Chairperson Johnston called for staff's next presentation.

Jon Froke, AICP, Planning Director stated that the following two cases would be heard concurrently, however, will require separate motions.

3. **GPA15-03:** A request by the City of Glendale Planning Commission to establish a Scenic Corridor on both sides of the Loop 101 (Agua Fria Freeway) between 51st Avenue and Bell Road. GPA15-03 is a request to amend the General Plan Map, the Arrowhead Ranch Specific Plan and the North Valley Specific Area Plan to establish a Scenic Corridor for this same area. The site is located on the Loop 101 between 51st Avenue and Bell Road (5900 West Loop 101 Highway). The site is located in the Cholla District. Staff contact: Jon Froke, AICP, Planning Director.
4. **ZTA15-01:** A request by the City of Glendale Planning Commission for a Zoning Text Amendment that will amend various sections of the Zoning Ordinance to establish a Scenic Corridor and to provide definitions and regulations. The amendment is intended to protect view corridors of the portion of the Loop 101 through Arrowhead Ranch and vicinity. This would include preserving existing natural areas, washes, desert, hills and mountains. Off-premise signs (billboard signs and digital billboard signs) would be prohibited in the Scenic Corridor. The site is located on the Loop 101 between 51st Avenue and Bell Road (5900 West Loop 101 Highway). The site is located in the Cholla District. Staff contact: Jon Froke, AICP, Planning Director.

Jon Froke, AICP, Planning Director, stated this was a request by the City of Glendale Planning Commission to establish a Scenic Corridor on both sides of the Loop 101 between 51st Avenue and Bell Road. GPA15-03 is a request to amend the General Plan Map, the Arrowhead Ranch Specific Plan and the North Valley Specific Area Plan to establish a Scenic Corridor for this

same area. He said the site is located on the Loop 101 between 51st Avenue and Bell Road. Also included is a request by the City of Glendale Planning Commission for a Zoning Text Amendment that will amend various sections of the Zoning Ordinance to establish a Scenic Corridor and to provide definitions and regulations. He noted the amendment is intended to protect view corridors of the portion of the Loop 101 through Arrowhead Ranch and vicinity.

Mr. Froke explained that each of these three plans need to be amended since they govern certain geographic portions of the Loop 101 in this area. He indicated that the south side of Beardsley Road between 51st and 55th avenues is not part of the Arrowhead Ranch Specific Plan. However, the portion of the Loop 101 from Union Hills Drive to Bell Road is part of the North Valley Specific Area Plan. Additionally, the request will establish a definition and other standards for a Scenic Corridor since no such definition, nor do standards, currently exist in the Zoning Ordinance.

Mr. Froke noted that prior to the neighborhood meeting on September 23, 2015 the applicant mailed notification postcards to 143 property owners and interested parties. Approximately 63 people were in attendance along with City Staff and Councilmember Tolmachoff. He said that there was overwhelming support for the Scenic Corridor and that the boundaries of the Scenic Corridor extend between 51st Avenue and Bell Road. He noted that since then, staff has received three telephone calls from nearby residents who are in support of the Scenic Corridor.

Additionally, he would like to provide some clarification on some of the narrative. He believes there had been some misunderstanding on the project's narrative with respect to adding the Scenic Corridor. He explained that back in 2012, there had been a prior zoning text amendment on the books regarding billboards. He read the text amendment for the record and added that it was not being changed. He hoped this clarification will alleviate any uncertainty. He also read through the text amendment and modified some of the language strictly for consistency.

In conclusion, Mr. Froke stated this request appears to meet the required findings. Staff recommends approval subject to the stipulations contained in the staff report.

Chairperson Johnston called for questions from the Commission.

Commissioner Hirsch asked for clarification on 7.110 D and asked if there would be any changes to this. Mr. Froke replied no. Commissioner Hirsch wondered as to the initiative from 2015 which apparently opened the door for electronic billboard applications. Mr. Froke explained that the verbiage in Section 5.910 had been proposed by the city attorney's office and staff was in support. He explained that for this case, they will not see any billboards on this section of the Loop 101. Commissioner Hirsch noted that there were no billboards in this stretch of the Loop 101; however, this does not address the potential for future billboard applications in other areas in the city. Mr. Froke stated he was correct.

Chairperson Johnston asked for any additional comments or questions. There were none.

Chairperson Johnston opened the public hearing.

Jason F. Mallette, a Cholla resident, stated his support of both of these applications. He thanked staff for all their hard work and time put into these cases. He appreciates that the city acted on the wishes of the citizens of Glendale.

Dr. Kathleen Goepfinger, Midwestern University President, stated her support of these two applications. She believes this will benefit the community and is in full support.

Nick Nochrehechi, an Arrowhead Estates resident, stated his support of these applications. He noted he only hopes the development does not impact his property negatively. Mr. Froke agreed and noted he should have explained earlier that the application will not impact people's ability to develop their property or impact surrounding businesses and retailer's current signage.

Connie Kiser, Glendale resident, stated her support of these applications. She thanked staff for their time and effort working on the signage issue and listening to the citizens of Glendale. She believed this was a very important vote since it determines the look of the city in the future.

Jen Deines, Glendale resident, stated her support of the Scenic Corridor and the great work the planning staff has done on this application. She appreciates their commitment to the residents and city.

Michele Tennyson, a Glendale resident, stated her support of the application. She wants to thank staff for all their work on this application and also for keeping the city beautiful. She asked why some of the language was changed. She also asked about what the process would be regarding large lighted signs such as the one at Mountainside. Mr. Froke explained that every commercial development that has been built or soon to be built will first go through the design review process to be approved. He added that regarding the language modifications, it was needed to implement the Scenic Corridor. He indicated the verbiage with the legal description is already in the zoning ordinance and that is not changing.

Ms. Tennyson stated her concern for sign pollution.

Chairperson Johnston thanked everyone attending tonight and for taking the time to come and comment on this important application.

Mr. Froke thanked the Commission for their patience in working with the Planning Commission on this application. He also thanked Ms. Perry for being very helpful throughout the process, specifically at the beginning of the project. He looks forward to concluding this item and moving it forward to City Council for their approval.

Chairperson Johnston closed the public hearing.

Chairperson Johnston called for a motion.

COMMISSIONER DOBBELAERE MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF CASE GPA15-03. VICE CHAIRPERSON LENOX SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney, stated the Planning Commission's actions are not final and the Commission's recommendation will be forwarded to City Council for further action.

Chairperson Johnston called for a motion.

COMMISSIONER HIRSCH MADE A MOTION TO RECOMMEND APPROVAL OF CASE ZTA15-01 WITH PROPOSED CHANGES. COMMISSIONER HARPER SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

James Gruber, Assistant City Attorney, stated the Planning Commission's actions are not final and the Commission's recommendation will be forwarded to City Council for further action.

OTHER BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

Chairperson Johnston asked if there was any Business from the Floor. There was none.

PLANNING STAFF REPORT

Chairperson Johnston asked for the staff report. There was none.

COMMISSION COMMENTS AND SUGGESTIONS

Chairperson Johnston called for Comments and Suggestions.

Commissioner Hirsch requested a workshop to discuss future measures to protect the entire city from future billboards. Chairperson Johnston asked Mr. Froke to place this request on the next available workshop.

Chairperson Johnston commented on the number of citizens who came out to speak on this issue. He thanked everyone for their participation and letting their voice be heard. He was very proud to be a citizen of Glendale.

NEXT MEETING: March 3, 2016.

ADJOURNMENT

WITH NO FURTHER BUSINESS, COMMISSIONER HARPER MADE A MOTION TO ADJOURN. COMMISSIONER LENOX SECONDED THE MOTION, WHICH WAS APPROVED UNANIMOUSLY.

The meeting was adjourned at 6:45 p.m.