MINUTES

CITIZENS TRANSPORTATION OVERSIGHT COMMISSION

5850 West Glendale Avenue
Glendale, Arizona 85301
City Hall, Room B-3
June 2, 2016
6:00 p.m.

MEMBERS PRESENT:	Tom Schmitt, Chair John Geurs, Vice Chair Gus Woodman Frank Johnson Roberta Podzius Jack Nylund Don Brazier James Grose Marie Nesfield Jeff McAffee
MEMBERS ABSENT:	None
OTHERS PRESENT:	Jack Lorbeer, Transportation Planning Manager Patrick Sage, Transportation Planner Purab Adabala, Senior Transportation Analyst

I. Call to Order

Chair Schmitt called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

II. Approval of the Agenda

Chair Schmitt called for approval of the agenda for the June 2, 2016 CTOC meeting.

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the agenda for the June 2, 2016 Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission as presented.

(Motion: Commissioner Grose; Second: Vice Chair Geurs; motion carried unanimously. Commissioners Nylund, Brazier, and McAffee were not yet present.)

III. Approval of Minutes from May 12, 2016 Meeting

Chair Schmitt called for approval of the minutes.

ACTION BY CTOC: Approval of the minutes from the May 12, 2016 meeting of the Citizens Transportation Oversight Commission as written.

(Motion: Commissioner Woodman; Second: Commissioner Johnson; motion carried unanimously. Commissioners Nylund, Brazier, and McAffee were not yet present.)

IV. Call to the Audience

No comments.

V. Commissioners and Staff Updates

[Commissioner McAffee entered the meeting.]

Vice Chair Geurs commented that at the April 24, 2016 City Council meeting, during which the Council voted on the West Phoenix/Central Glendale High Capacity Study recommendations, some Council members appeared to not be familiar with the information provided to the CTOC and the Citizens Working Group regarding the study, and the resulting discussions and recommendations from those bodies. Vice Chair Geurs wondered if and how the CTOC minutes are distributed to the Council members, and expressed the opinion that a formal process should be established if not already in place. Mr. Sage explained that under the current process, the full minutes are uploaded to the City website once the minutes have been reviewed and approved by the CTOC. However, Transportation staff does not distribute the final, approved minutes directly to Council members. Vice Chair Geurs asked if the Council members are notified when the minutes are posted to the City website. Mr. Sage replied that Transportation staff does not provide direct notification.

[Commissioner Nylund entered the meeting.]

Mr. Lorbeer stated that staff will evaluate the current process for distribution of the CTOC meeting minute and consider opportunities to make the process more effective.

Vice Chair Geurs also suggested the City adopt a standard template for the minutes from all City boards and commissions, so that they are more uniform and accessible for City Council member review.

Chair Schmitt stated that during the April 24 City Council meeting, Council member Tolmachoff provided informed comments regarding the high capacity transit study process and recommendations. Based on her comments, it was clear (to him) that she had read the CTOC minutes.

The development of a brief synopsis of all of the CTOC activities and meeting minutes regarding the West Phoenix/Central Glendale High Capacity Study was suggested, since the project was discussed over several meetings.

Commissioner Podzius commented that one of the Council members was new and that may have led to additional questions by that Council member.

Commissioner Podzius stressed that it is very important for CTOC Commissioners, when making public statements, to remain consistent with their prior votes on Commission business, and accurately represent the Commission vote outcome. Chair Schmitt agreed, and asked for Commissioner Johnson to explain his statement made during the April 24 City Council meeting, where he refuted that the CTOC vote in support of the West Phoenix/Central Glendale High Capacity Transit study was unanimous.

Commissioner Johnson read aloud a detailed explanation of his public comments made at the April 24 Council meeting. Commissioner Johnson stated that while at the Council meeting, after reviewing Resolution 5108, which was on the Council agenda to be voted upon, he became deeply concerned regarding the term "unanimous support" in regards to the recommendations that CTOC had voted upon and that are referenced in the Resolution. Commissioner Johnson stated that he did not remember voting to support a high capacity transit route along Glenn Avenue, only further evaluation of route alternatives, and that he expressed concern at a CTOC meeting regarding the width of Glenn

Avenue to accommodate both automobile traffic and light rail operation requirements. He noted that this comment was not included in the final minutes from the February 18th CTOC meeting.

Commissioner Johnson stated that while he does support light rail to downtown Glendale and even further west to the stadium/entertainment district, he does think that other less expensive routes need more consideration. Commissioner Johnson added that he meant no disrespect to the CTOC, but felt obligated to express his opinion at the City Council meeting. Commissioner Johnson announced his resignation and exited the meeting.

[Commissioner Brazier entered the meeting.]

Commissioner Podzius commented that all persons are entitled to express their opinions at public meetings; however, it is important that members not make statements that publically contradict their votes made as a member of their Commission.

Mr. Lorbeer stated that CTOC meeting minutes are prepared and presented to members for their review prior to adoption, so that items missing or requiring correction can be identified. CTOC members should note any necessary corrections prior to voting for approval of the minutes during the subsequent CTOC meeting.

Commissioner Nesfield inquired as to why the Grand Avenue route for light rail was not selected. Commissioner Podzius explained that this was due to ridership numbers presented by Valley Metro, which indicated that the 43rd Avenue route had higher estimated ridership.

Vice Chair Geurs indicated that he also spoke at the April 24 City Council meeting, but did not indicate that he was a CTOC member; rather, he spoke as a private citizen.

VI. Manager's Report

Mr. Lorbeer provided a status update/information on the following topics. Commissioner comments are included as well.

- School Zone Speed Limits: 30 MPH Speed Limit on Arterials

  Mr. Lorbeer explained that this is the appropriate speed reduction for a school zone on an arterial, according to Arizona Revised Statutes. Speed reductions by more than 10 mph compared to the regular posted speed are not permitted by the ARS.

  Since this issue and others raised recently by CTOC members are best addressed as enforcement issues, staff is exploring the potential to conduct regular coordination meetings with the Glendale Police Department regarding transportation enforcement issues that are brought through CTOC. Commissioner Podzius stated that the local CAT Officer for Cholla District would be a good contact for this issue.

- Speed Limit Policy – Comparison with Adjacent Jurisdictions

  Mr. Lorbeer explained that currently the maximum speed limit differential between Glendale streets and any adjacent jurisdiction is 5 mph, and that City staff is performing a speed limit study that will soon be completed and documented. Chair Schmitt commented that a 5 mph differential may not appear to be a very big difference; however, to a motorist it could appear to be a "speed trap." Chair Schmitt still had concerns with the 5 mph differential.

- Bus Stop Safety – Overnight Camping at Bus Stops
  Mr. Lorbeer explained that the current bench design for bus stops in the City include "vandal bars" that dissuade people from lying down on the benches. When possible, these vandal bars are retrofitted to existing benches.

  Vice Chair Geurs expressed curiosity regarding the cost for retrofitting benches versus stricter enforcement of the existing urban camping laws. Mr. Lorbeer commented that the police must be cognizant of actual bus riders versus those who are loitering at bus stops.

- West Phoenix/Central Glendale HCT Study
  Mr. Lorbeer provided a recap from the April 24 Council resolution regarding the study and subsequent project developments/updates.

  Vice Chair Geurs inquired if Valley Metro will return to CTOC to provide an update on the planning process. Vice Chair Geurs wanted to know more about the route elimination process and why various routes and modes of transportation were eliminated. Vice Chair Geurs added that this way, the public will know all of the reasons why certain routes and modes were eliminated. Commissioner Podzius stated that Valley Metro has already provided presentations to CTOC over multiple meetings on the various routes and modes considered, and the process rational for elimination and eventual selection of the preferred route and mode. Chair Schmitt commented that a summary of all Valley Metro presentations would be beneficial.

- North Glendale Park & Ride
  Mr. Lorbeer discussed that site identification and land acquisition process continues, with negotiations on preferred site currently underway.

  Chair Schmitt inquired about the City policy on condemnation. Mr. Lorbeer replied that the City does not want to utilize that method to acquire the parcel. Vice Chair Geurs noted that the condemnation policy was used for the Boys and Girls Club in Phoenix. Mr. Lorbeer agreed that this policy was used in the past; however, at this time a friendly negotiation is being utilized.

- FY2017-2041 GO Program
  Annual (2015) financial update and Draft GO Program of Projects will be presented at the August 2016 meeting.

- Northern Parkway
  Mr. Lorbeer explained that the project is on hold pending collection of additional traffic counts, assessment, and analysis by MAG.

  Chair Schmitt commented that the City of Glendale has already spent funds and committed additional funds to the project. Mr. Lorbeer replied in the positive and stated that this will be a point of discussion with the other partners in the project. Mr. Lorbeer added that this is a long range project, 10-20 years, and it is important to maintain the long term vision. Chair Schmitt inquired as to the agreement made with the other cities involved in the project. Mr. Lorbeer commented that an agreement was indeed made; however, the agreement language allows for partners to pull out of the project.

- Glendale Airport – GO Funding

Mr. Lorbeer discussed that GO funds are used for local matches for all Airport capital projects, and that the 2017: 5-Year Airport CIP includes multiple paving projects.

Commissioner Podzius stated that she was interested in the amount of GO Funds used at the Airport, as there have been some major paving projects completed recently. Commissioner Podzius also requested a tour of the Airport since it is within the CTOC purview.

Chair Schmitt thanked Mr. Lorbeer for the report.

VII. CTOC Performance Measures Annual Assessment

Mr. Sage gave a presentation on the Annual Assessment of the CTOC Goals and Performance Measures, which included the following information:

- Purpose & History
- CTOC Goals
  - Ensure Public Input
  - Ensure Governmental Accountability
  - Monitor Fund Expenditure
  - Recommend Adjustments to the GO Program
  - Make Recommendations to Council on:
- Evaluation Period
  - Trial Evaluation Period: September 1, 2015 through June 30, 2016
  - First Full Evaluation Period: FY2017 – July 1, 2016 through June 30, 2017

Commissioner McAffee asked how the Commissioners could obtain a calendar of events for achievement of the Public Input Goal. Mr. Sage noted that meeting dates for all City boards and commissions are posted on the City website, and that Commissioners can also attend state and regional events/meetings to fulfill the goal. Mr. Sage expressed that staff provides information to members on potential meetings and events of interest when they come to staff's attention. Commissioner Podzius also suggested signing up for the Council members' email lists.

Commissioner Nylund inquired if unmet goals would affect funding. Mr. Sage replied in the negative, but noted that it is certainly in CTOC's best interest to achieve all of the goals.

Chair Schmitt thanked staff for the presentation.

VIII. CTOC Roles and Responsibilities

Responding to a request from Chair Schmitt, Mr. Lorbeer gave a presentation on CTOC roles and responsibilities as currently defined. The presentation included the following items:

- CTOC is Governed by City Code Section 2-320. The code describes that the powers and duties of the commission shall be advisory in nature and all acts and actions thereof shall be subject to review by the City Council; CTOC authority is not limited solely to oversight of GO Program; any changes to the Powers and Duties of CTOC would take Council Action to amend the City Code, and; CTOC itself does not have the power to modify its own role
- CTOC Powers and Duties as defined by Section 2-320. These include
  - Ensure that transportation projects and programs approved by voters are implemented in a fair, cost effective and timely manner in accord with the voters

    - Advise the City Council on regional transportation issues, public transit, bicycle issues, and issues related to alternative modes of transportation.
    - Include sales tax funded projects in a fiscally balanced long range program that is updated every year, submitted for Council approval.
    - Provide an annual report on the program to Council.
  - Roles and Responsibilities – Next Steps
    - CTOC input on roles and responsibilities
    - Review CTOC input with Transportation Management
    - Transportation Staff to provide recommendations on the commission roles and responsibilities

Mr. Lorbeer commented that he recently met with the City Attorney's Office for guidance, who confirmed that, based on the applicable city code, CTOC could advise Council on transportation matters that are not directly related to GO Funds. Mr. Lorbeer added that CTOC could even advise on bicycle issues, although there is an active Citizens Bicycle Advisory Committee.

Chair Schmitt commented that at a recent Council meeting, the Council was reviewing an ordinance which prohibited backing into a parking space. Council member Aldama had asked if any city commission had reviewed and made a recommendation on the issue, which had not occurred. Chair Schmitt noted that it appeared that Council wanted information and/or recommendation from a city commission. Chair Schmitt wondered if this was an issue which the CTOC could have reviewed and made a recommendation. Mr. Lorbeer replied in the positive and added that the CTOC and staff could set a scope of issues to be brought before CTOC for discussion and recommendation if the issue is not directly related to Go Program.

Commissioner Podzius stated that Council should be informed that CTOC is available to advise on transportation issues in addition to Go Program. Chair Schmitt inquired as to how CTOC would be informed of issues outside of GO Program requiring attention. Mr. Adabala replied that staff is usually informed of issues a month or two before Council vote. Chair Schmitt suggested a list of bulleted items. Mr. Lorbeer commented a balance of items for review will be needed to ensure CTOC is reviewing issues of strong importance or high visibility. Commissioner McAffee inquired as to how the CTOC agenda is set. Mr. Lorbeer stated that CTOC and staff together set the agenda via the "Future Agenda" items section of the meetings. Chair Schmitt stated that he does contact Mr. Sage with agenda suggested. Commissioner Podzius agreed that she does so as well. Mr. Lorbeer noted that all Commissioners are welcome to provide staff with agenda topic requests via email, in addition to during meetings under "Future Agenda Items."

Commissioner Nylund commented that the CTOC is seated with members of great experience and background and Council should utilize the talent of CTOC.

Mr. Lorbeer and staff will work to develop the process of adding additional agenda items requiring review and recommendation outside of the GO fund scope.

IX. <u>Go Program Audit</u>

Mr. Adabala requested that the CTOC table this item until the next CTOC meeting. Staff needs additional time to address multiple recommendations identified in the audit.

X. Future Agenda Items

(Commissioners reviewed the staff-generated list of upcoming agenda items, which was provided as a handout and compiled of topics previously requested by Commissioners and from topics identified as relevant by staff).

Commissioner Nylund requested a presentation by the appropriate City department on right of way maintenance along City streets, particularly related to landscaping and visibility from side streets. Commissioner Nylund commented that in his neighborhood there are areas where shrubs are blocking the traffic line of sight, and accidents have occurred as a result. Commissioner Podzius suggested speaking with Councilmember Tolmachoff. Mr. Adabala asked Commissioner Nylund to email staff specific details regarding the location in any of these types of instances, explaining that that Commissioners do not have to wait for a Commission meeting to inform staff of concerns.

Vice Chair Geurs suggested that a roll call be taken for CTOC votes, especially in light of the recent issue with the vote related to the high capacity transit study. Commissioner Nylund agreed with the roll call vote concept. Chair Schmitt agreed that a roll call vote could be done, particularly with a controversial issue. Commissioner Woodman suggested that the name of the dissenting vote should be included in the minutes as well.

Vice Chair Geurs asked if Commissioner absences should be formally noted as part of the meeting agenda (such as with a roll call agenda item), citing that another city commission on which he participated documented absences in this manner. Commissioner Podzius commented that Commissioners should state during meetings if they cannot make an upcoming meeting, which would then be included in the minutes. Mr. Sage added that Commissioners are also requested to contact him when possible prior to a meeting to inform of an absence if they did not provide that information during the prior meeting.

Vice Chair Geurs suggested increasing the estimated time for Agenda Item V. for Commissioners to make specific comments. Commissioner Grose reminded all that when replying to an email from staff, only hit "Reply" not "Reply All" to avoid issues with the Open Meeting Law.

Chair Schmitt noted that he does recall that Commissioner Johnson did expressed concerns about the width of Glenn Avenue in regards to the light rail issue, which Chair Schmitt did not see reflected in the meeting minutes.

XI. Next Meeting Time

The July 7 meeting was cancelled. The next CTOC meeting is scheduled for Thursday, August 4, 2016 at 6:00 p.m. in Room B-3 in City Hall.

XII. Adjournment

The meeting was adjourned by consensus at 7:55 p.m.

Tom Schmitt, Chair

SPECIAL ACCOMMODATIONS

Please contact transportation staff at (623) 930-2940 at least three (3) days prior to the meeting for special accommodations. Hearing impaired persons please use the Arizona Relay Service at 1-800-367-8939.