

CITY OF GLENDALE
PARKS AND RECREATION ADVISORY COMMISSION
MEETING MINUTES
GLENDALE MUNICIPAL OFFICE COMPLEX
5850 W. GLENDALE AVENUE – B3
July 11, 2016
6:00 P.M.

MEMBERS PRESENT: Manuel Padia, Chair
Kerry Dewberry, Vice Chair
Lorrie Moreno
Henry Rosas
Alicia H. Rubio
Ethan McAfee
Barbara R. Cole

MEMBERS ABSENT: John Faris

OTHERS PRESENT: Erik Strunk, Director Public Facilities, Recreation & Special Events
Tim Barnard, Assistant Director
Stephanie Miller, Program Manager
Stone Lieberman, Staff Intern
Hillary Turby, Project Manager Norris Design

I. CALL TO ORDER

Chair Padia called the meeting to order at 6:00 p.m.

II. ROLL CALL

Chair Padia took roll call. Mr. Strunk announced that Commissioner Rubio would be late due to a school board meeting.

III. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Vice Chair Dewberry motioned, second by Commissioner Moreno, to approve the May 16, 2016 meeting minutes as written. Motion carried 6 – 0. [Commissioner Rubio was not yet present.]

IV. BUSINESS FROM THE FLOOR

None.

V. PARKS, RECREATION AND LIBRARY SERVICES FEE AND REVENUE STUDY UPDATE

Mr. Barnard announced that staff has contracted with Norris Design Group to review, evaluate and make recommendations regarding the fees associated with the services and programs for the Parks, Recreation and Library work groups. Mr. Barnard noted that the work groups charge rent for the use of real city property and user fees for programs and services offered by their respective departments. Mr. Barnard added that fees are collected for over 500 different types of programs and services, which generate approximately \$3.0 million in revenue.

Mr. Barnard provided the following information:

- The ability to set and collect fees for these work groups is in the Glendale City Code, including sections for the Civic Center, Glendale Public Library, and Parks and Recreation.

- The fees collected come from a variety of programs, activities, leagues, classes, and ramada/room/field rentals. The fees charged by the work groups can be characterized in three different ways:
 1. Facility Use Fees are those established by a resolution of Council that may be specified in City Code, such as overdue book fines; those considered a rental of city-owned real property, such as a room rental at the Adult Center or sports field rental at Sahuaro Ranch Park; or those recommended by Council as a cost recovery.
 2. Self-Sustaining Fees are those that are charged based on market conditions, subject to staff adjustment and are used to cover the cost to provide the program or service. These are value-added opportunities that are offered to the community, but have a personal benefit. Examples include before and after-school programs, summer camps, and Special Interest Classes. Self-sustaining programs should not impact the General Fund.
 3. Administrative Fees are those that are charged to cover costs that the City may incur outside of a Facility Use Fee, such as the provision of extra chairs, security staff or extra staff labor, additional tables, equipment, refreshments, and items sold for convenience. The establishment of these fees is also staff driven and based on market pricing.

Mr. Barnard introduced Ms. Hillary Turby, Project Manager for Norris Design, who gave an update on the Parks, Recreation and Library Services Fee and Revenue Study, which included the following:

- Why is a Fee and Revenue Study Important?
 - Continue to deliver high quality recreation facilities, programs, and services
 - Anticipate future needs
 - Assess market competitiveness
 - Provide recommendations to City Council regarding potential policy changes and fee adjustments
 - Enhance ability to respond to market conditions
 - Responsive to community recreation needs
- Study Goals and Objectives
 - Examine existing programming and rental fees
 - Compare City of Glendale fees to nearby jurisdictions:
 - Chandler, Goodyear, Mesa, Peoria, Phoenix, Surprise, Tempe
 - Compare City of Glendale fees to other providers
 - Review and make recommendations regarding current fee policies and procedures
 - Assess community needs
 - Elicit public input
 - Develop recommendations for updating pricing and financial policies
- Community Outreach
 - Parks and Recreation Advisory Commission Meeting
 - Monday, July 11, 2016
 - Public Open House #1
 - Wednesday, June 29, 2016; 5-7 p.m.
 - Rose Lane Recreation Center
 - Intercept Questionnaire
 - Monday, July 18, 2016
 - Face-to-Face interviews at three sites
 - Public Open House #2
 - Thursday, September 1, 2016; 5-7 p.m.
 - Foothills Recreation & Aquatics Center
 - Questionnaire
 - Available through August, on paper and online

- Five minute completion time
- Distribution
 - Public Open Houses
 - Dedicated Website
 - Media Release
 - Glendale Star/Glendale Today Ads
 - City of Glendale Centers and Libraries
 - Glendale Community Centers
 - Glendale Adult Center
 - Foothills Recreation & Aquatics Center
 - Main Library
 - Foothills Branch Library
 - Velma Teague Branch Library
- Study Elements
 - Demographic Analysis
 - Activities/Class Fee Analysis
 - Rental Fee Comparison
 - Economic Benchmarking
 - Policy Review
 - Public Outreach
- Next Steps
 - Completed
 - Demographics Analysis
 - Relevant Plan Review
 - Current
 - Community Outreach
 - Fee and Revenue Study
 - Activity/Class Fee Analysis
 - Rental Fee Comparison
 - Policy Review
 - Next Steps
 - Recommendations
 - Presentations to City Council

Ms. Turby explained that traditional public open houses have been less successful over the years and the intercept survey is being used to question users while they are out at the facilities. Chair Padia inquired about the use of tablets versus paper and pen for the surveys. Mr. Barnard replied that the use of tablets could be researched but would more likely be used for the Master Plan which is a larger effort. Ms. Turby commented that an online survey link is provided at the bottom of the paper surveys, however, at the library a computer could possibly be loaded with the questionnaire for use.

Chair Padia suggested providing an incentive to the public for completing the survey, such as a free class registration or a free prize. Mr. Barnard commented that this has been used in the past with the department Master Plan because it is such a large effort, but could be reviewed for this survey as well.

Commissioner Cole commented that she would like to use the Glendale Adult Center but it is only open until 5:00 p.m. and she works full-time. Commissioner Cole suggested expansion of the Adult Center hours to allow use by those who work during the day. Mr. Barnard stated that this suggestion has been brought to Council

before along with a request for increasing library hours. Mr. Barnard commented that these suggestions will be part of the discussion regarding budget priorities.

Commissioner Cole suggested including the survey in the Councilmember district newsletters.

Vice Chair Dewberry inquired if user demographics would be included in the data study. Ms. Turby replied that her group does have various demographic and class registration data.

Commissioner Rosas asked how the low-income population is considered in the study and setting of fees. Mr. Strunk explained that in the past, the department had different pricing models; however, with the economic downturn, Council directed an equalized pricing model, which has created some challenges. The pricing model is being reviewed in the Revenue and Fee Study. Mr. Barnard stated that the data revealed in the study would direct any need for adjustment. Mr. Barnard added that some areas offer scholarships for low-income participants and the City has also entered into agreements with non-profits for the use of the five City Community Centers to provide free or reduced cost programming for low-income youth. Mr. Barnard explained that these Community Center programs include sports, art, traditional STEM, BMX STEAM, and more.

Mr. Barnard stressed that the Commission will be kept apprised of the continued progress of the study.

VI. THUNDERBIRD CONSERVATION PARK SURVEY AND VOLUNTEER INITIATIVE

Ms. Miller introduced Mr. Lieberman, who is a senior at Northern Arizona University and a summer intern with the Public Facilities, Recreation & Special Events Department.

Mr. Lieberman provided an update on the Thunderbird Conservation Park user-survey. The first focus area involves creating, administering, and analyzing the results of an intercept survey at Thunderbird Conservation Park to better understand the opinions, wants, and needs of park patrons. The second focus area involves developing opportunities for a volunteer program at the Park.

Mr. Lieberman noted that he designed the user-survey and distributed the survey to the Commissioners. Mr. Lieberman commented on the following regarding the survey:

- Hardcopy: Mr. Lieberman administered the survey on an intercept basis for five days in June, which generated a limited response due to the heat.
- Online: The survey was posted on the City website, however, this also generated limited response.
- Councilmember Tolmachoff district newsletter: A link to the survey was included in the newsletter. This proved be the most effective method because readers of the newsletter already have a vested interest in the area.
- Response to date:
 - 108 responses received
 - Average age: 52 years old
 - 70% of respondents were from 85308 and 85310 zip codes
 - 20% of respondents indicated that they would volunteer at the park in some fashion

Commissioner Cole inquired as to the type of volunteer positions available, as she herself may be interested. Mr. Lieberman replied that the exact duties have not been determined yet. Mr. Strunk elaborated that a possible concept would be a docent-type of opportunity such as welcoming users, providing educational information and also keeping an eye on the park.

Commissioner Cole asked if the survey was still ongoing. Mr. Lieberman stated that the intercept is completed, but the online surveys will be available through Wednesday, July 13th. Commissioner Cole requested staff send the survey link to the Commissioners so that they may in turn send the link onto contacts, friends, and family for completion of the survey.

Mr. Barnard commented that this survey will not provide very scientific data, but is more of an outreach effort. Chair Padia praised staff for a great job on the survey and starting point for obtaining user feedback.

Mr. Strunk stated that staff would keep the Commissioners apprised of the final survey responses.

VII. REVISED BENCH/TREE PROGRAM POLICY PROGRAM

Mr. Strunk stated that a recent decision regarding a request for a tree planted in honor of a child who passed away spurred the necessity for review of the Dedicate-A-Tree and Dedicate-A-Bench programs. These programs provide individuals or groups the opportunity to honor a memory, individual, or event by dedicating a tree and/or a bench in a Glendale park. Mr. Strunk noted that the current city policy does not allow for permanent memorial items left at a public site and this is consistent with other valley cities. The proposed policy update allows for a few options.

The proposed updated policy was provided to the Commission for prior review before the meeting. Mr. Strunk explained that with the Dedicate-A-Tree program, the memorial plaque would not be installed at the tree site, but rather the applicant would be provided with the plaque to be kept elsewhere. Mr. Strunk noted that with the Dedicate-A-Bench program, the memorial plaque would be embedded in the park bench.

Commissioner Cole inquired as to the size of the plaque to be placed on the bench. Mr. Strunk replied that it would be approximately 3"x5" or 3"x6". Mr. Strunk stated that the benches would most likely be concrete, but could be made of materials that would match other benches at the park requested.

Chair Padia suggested including the following in the program brochure in order to avoid any confusion with the program:

- The size of the plaque.
- The tree palette available at each City park.
- Using bold and/or underlined type font for the following sentence "Please note that the placement of permanent markers or plaques with the tree is not permitted." Or, having the applicant initial near this sentence.

Mr. Strunk announced that staff would like to have the new dedication policy up and running by August 1st and the Commissioner suggestions will be taken into consideration.

Vice Chair Dewberry motioned, second by Commissioner Cole, to approve the updated City of Glendale Dedicate-A-Tree and Dedicate-A-Bench Policy. Motion carried 6 – 0. [Commissioner Rubio was not yet present.]

VIII. BRIEFING ON MURPHY PARK & AMPHITHEATER EVENT ACTIVITIES

Mr. Barnard and Mr. King gave a presentation and provided a detailed written report on the proposed use and success to date of the two-year pilot program intended to increase the use of Murphy Park and the City Hall Amphitheater, effective January 1, 2016. Mr. Barnard noted that the Amphitheater was recently renamed the E. Lowell Rogers Amphitheatre.

Mr. Barnard commented that the goal of the initiative was to increase the use of the Amphitheater and to bring the community residents family-friendly programming during the summer.

Mr. Barnard provided the following information:

- Overview
 - Amphitheater opened in 1984 as part of City Hall.
 - A 2,100 sq. ft. performance area = 400 persons.
 - Of the 1,248 programmable premier hours at the amphitheater (Thursday-Sunday, 4 p.m. – 10 p.m.), a three-year total-use average comes to 200 hours per year, which represents a 16% total usage.
 - 47 events were planned for FY15-16.
 - October 2015: Council provided direction to initiate two-year trial to increase events at Murphy Park and the Amphitheater.
 - Pilot Program stated on January 1, 2016:
 - Strengthen “Centerline” initiative
 - Offer use of amphitheater and Murphy Park at no charge
 - Special Events Ordinance will be followed
 - Faith-based and commercial endeavors exempt from the program
 - Increase in events by 10% each year for FY16-17 and FY17-18
 - Develop community-based review team
- It’s Happening at The Murph
 - Summer Band Series
 - Movies by Moonlight
 - Christmas in July
 - Cinco de Mayo
 - Dia de Los Muertos
 - Glendale Glitters
 - Fall Film Series
 - Chocolate Festival
 - Performing Arts
 - Dog Days of Summer
 - Family Fun Night
 - GAIN Night
 - Christmas Parade
 - Navy Brass Band

Mr. King presented the following:

- Overview: Movies by Moonlight
 - 3/25: Minions
 - 4/8: Inside Out
 - 4/22: The Good Dinosaur
 - 5/6: Frozen
 - 5/20: Big Hero 6
- Complimentary popcorn and snow-cones – incentives for completing a survey. It is estimated that 96% of the attendees completed the survey.
- Collaborated with Convention and Visitors Bureau and reached out to community partners for effective marketing of the events
- Included one bounce house, one bounce slide, balloon twisting for opening night and a visit from Anna & Elsa during “Frozen”

- The first night, approximately 100 people attended the event. The largest night saw approximately 300 attendees.
- There was a lot of activity before and after the movies. Many families attended every movie.
- A 20-foot high inflatable screen was used with a high-tech sound system.

Mr. Strunk commented that the Movies by Moonlight event was very successful and made a big impact on the community. Mr. Strunk stated that he will invite a representative from the Convention and Visitors Bureau to share information regarding downtown events and the impact on the City.

Mr. King continued with the following regarding Movies by Moonlight:

- City Publicity
 - Visit Glendale
 - Posters & Flyers
 - Delivered to 91 businesses and city ports
 - Listed on Chamber of Commerce website
 - E-Blast to all Chamber of Commerce members as well as Facebook
 - Listed on City of Glendale Facebook and Sizzling Summer Fun
 - Displayed on the “Fun at the Murphy” website
 - Press release to the community
 - Multiple City Council meetings
 - Advertised at City of Glendale Health Fair
 - Advertised at the Libraries
 - Flyers posted in Dial-a-Ride & Gus Bus
 - Advertised in “Glendale at Play” magazine
- Budget

○ Movie Screen Equipment	\$ 3,975.00
○ Movie License	\$ 1,569.50
○ Inflatables	\$ 3,553.60
○ Pop Corn	\$ 783.75
○ Kona Ice	\$ 1,687.50
○ Staff	\$ 567.00
○ Marketing	\$ 1,202.70
○ Special Appearance Characters	\$ 287.40
○ Event Equipment	\$ 399.33
○ Total	\$14,025.78
- Survey Results (% satisfaction)
 - Volunteers: 92%
 - Vendors: 88%
 - Location: 92%
 - Parking: 98%
 - Movie: 92%
 - Activities: 93%
 - Overall: 91%
- Comments
 - “Very Fun!”
 - “Thank you for everything”
 - “Awesome!”
 - “Great idea for the whole community”
 - “Good job”

- “Great that this is available for families”
- “I love this event”
- “So nice that this is free to families”

Pictures of the events were displayed.

Mr. Barnard noted that Councilmember Aldama originally proposed the summer movie idea. Councilmember Aldama brought the concept to staff who developed plans and moved on implementation.

Mr. King stated that the movie event could be expanded to bi-annual or to other areas of the City.

Mr. Strunk stressed the importance of community connection via the events and thanked Mr. King and Mr. Sean McGary who spearheaded the events and ensured success.

Commissioner Cole inquired about participation from businesses surrounding Murphy Park. Mr. King stated that staff reached out to the businesses for the possibility of snack donations; however, no offers were received.

Chair Padia made the following suggestions for other events at the Amphitheater:

- Special Interest Class Showcase such as a performance from a children’s dance class. This may encourage others to sign up for the classes.
- A fitness class in the park, such as Zumba, yoga, or tai chi.
- Battle of the Bands or Teen Talent Show

Commissioner Cole suggested a karate class demonstration.

Mr. Barnard thanked the Commissioners for their suggestions.

IX. ANNUAL SUMMER RETREAT

Mr. Strunk facilitated a discussion regarding agenda topics and the date for the Commission’s Annual Summer Retreat. The topics recommended by staff include the following:

- Update on the Parks and Recreation Master Plan and discussion of Commission involvement with several Master Plan activities
- Discussion and review of the new department and key staff
- Update on key department projects
- Discussion on Glendale trends
- FY16-17 Commission work plan
- Possibility of moving the Commission meeting from Mondays to another day of the week

Mr. Strunk asked for Commissioner topics or suggestions.

Commissioner Rosas noted that Glendale has been a Tree City USA for a quite a while and suggested that the Commission sponsor or participate in an environmental event.

Commissioner Dewberry was looking forward to getting into the details of the Master Plan.

Commissioner Cole would like to hear more about the Master Plan, activities for active adults and adults without children, an update on the Archery Range at Heroes Park, and an update on the STEM programs at the Community Centers.

Mr. Strunk offered the possibility of hosting a Commission meeting at one of the City Community Centers.

Commissioner Moreno was also looking forward to the Master Plan discussion and suggested a discussion on reinstating past recreation programs, such as the 4th of July event. Commissioner Moreno would like to see it moved from Westgate to another location. Commissioner Moreno stressed the need for more programming in south Glendale.

Chair Padia would like to see more focus on a Youth Master Plan. Chair Padia stated that he and Ms. Yates met once to discuss a Youth Master Plan and would like to explore the issue further. Chair Padia stated that a Youth Master Plan would solidify Glendale's commitment to its youth. Chair Padia stressed that Parks and Recreation is not only a City department, but a way of life for the community.

The Commission agreed by consensus to schedule the retreat on August 13, 2016.

Chair Padia asked staff to contact the absent Commissioners regarding the date.

Staff will solidify a meeting location such as the Glendale Adult Center, Heroes Park or Community Center North.

[Commissioner Rubio entered the meeting.]

X. STAFF UPDATES

Mr. King's update included the following:

- The department is very busy as kids are on summer break. Summer camps are doing well with steady numbers and fun/educational programming for the children.
- The last day of summer programming is August 6th.
- Saturday, July 16th: 3rd Annual Daddy-Daughter Dance at the Foothills Recreation and Aquatics Center. Pre-registration cost is \$15.00 for dads and \$5.00 for daughters.

Mr. Barnard's update included the following:

- Mr. Bryan Wagner is the new Parks Superintendent. Mr. Fred Sanchez has been hired as the new Parks Manager.
- On June 22nd, a Blue Palo Verde in honor of J. Pateen was planted at Thunderbird Conservation Park as part of the Dedicate-A-Tree program, prior to the new policy update.
- The City purchased the Pendergast property for an additional parking lot.
- Weekend staff for Sahuaro Ranch Park was hired for special projects.
- Volunteers from Leadership West worked with GCON to spread crushed granite and pea gravel at the Heroes Park Archery Range. Little to no City money was spent on the project. All site work has been completed. An RFP has been posted for an operator for the range. The Mayor would like a grand opening for the park, which is estimated to be in October 2016. A picture of the volunteer group was displayed, which included Mayor Weiers.
- "Call of Doodie": This is a dog waste awareness program which encourages park users to pick up pet waste. Pictures of the intended signage to be used at parks were displayed. The signage is mobile and removable. Special focus is on Thunderbird Conservation Park.

Commissioner Cole suggested that staff hand out the small dog waste bag holders, which clip onto leashes at parks or City events.

Mr. Strunk noted that Commissioner Faris was absent due to illness and excused. The Commissioners requested that a card be sent to Commissioner Faris on their behalf. Mr. Strunk stated that he will invite a

representative from the Convention and Visitors Bureau to share information regarding the events downtown and the impact on the City.

XI. COMMISSION COMMENTS

Commissioner Cole was looking forward to the summer retreat and items to be discussed. Commissioner Cole felt that the Commission worked very well together as a group.

Chair Padia stated that he attended the first Fee and Revenue Study Public Open House and noted that staff did a great job. Chair Padia is also looking forward to the retreat.

XII. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:52 p.m. by consensus.

The next regular meeting will be held on September 12, 2016, at 6:00 p.m. at the Glendale Municipal Office Complex, 5850 W. Glendale Avenue, B3.

Respectfully submitted,

Denise Kazmierczak